COMPLIANCE OF TECHNICAL AND VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING COLLEGES’ CURRICULUM IMPLEMENTATION WITH THE NATIONAL STRATEGY AND POLICY

BY

PHIWOKUHLE BONGIWE NGUBANE

A DESSERTATION SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY OF EDUCATION IN FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENT FOR THE MASTERS DEGREE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF CURRICULUM AND INSTRUCTIONAL STUDIES AT THE UNIVERSITY OF ZULULAND

Promoter : Dr. D W Mncube
Co-Promoter: Dr. M.S Mabusela
DECLARATION

I, PHIWOKUHLE BONGIWE NGUBANE hereby declare that this dissertation, entitled "Compliance of Technical and Vocational Education and Training colleges’ curriculum implementation with the National strategy and policy", is my own original work and has never been submitted to any university for the award of any degree. All the sources used have been acknowledged in the form of references.

Signed by ______________________ on the ___ day of _________________ 2016
ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study was to determine whether the Technical and Vocational Education and Training colleges’ NCV curriculum structure complies with the national strategy and policy stipulations in offering WBE for students. The CASE study was conducted at the Umfolozi TVET College, specifically on two campuses of the college in northern KwaZulu-Natal. The NCV programmes were earmarked for the study, as its curriculum covers the workplace-based education (WBE) component. This study used purposive sampling to identify the sample size of 21, which comprised of two campus managers, six senior lecturers and thirteen WBE champions.

Qualitative and quantitative approaches were employed in the study. The findings of this study reveal that the college management do not give necessary support to the implementers on the ground to carry out the WBE programme. It was also discovered that the college management seem not to understand their role in ensuring compliance with regard to the WBE implementation. It was evident that, there is a need not only to maintain strong ties with existing host employers, but also to ensure that new host employers are recruited to help address the shortage of them. It was evident from the findings that a number of respondents were not aware of the policies guiding the implementation of WBE. The results indicate that there is no regular training provided for implementers of WBE, such as the WBE champions. There is no clearness in the way the WBE budget is administered, and no proper planning of the budget (which is not administered on sites, but controlled centrally), and no workable plan in place to manage finances. The study recommends that there should be a clear vision for the implementation of WBE, and that vision should be clearly communicated to all role players to ensure effective implementation of the programme.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to God Almighty for the wisdom, strength, and ability to pull through no matter the circumstance at hand, to see the completion of this project, without Him by my side, I would have never come this far.

I wish to extend my heartfelt gratitude to the following individuals for their enormous contribution and support towards completion of this project:

- A special word of gratitude goes to my supervisor, Dr. Dumsani W Mncube for his support and encouragement from the very onset of this project until its completion. An extra-mile and effort he took towards seeing to it that I obtain the necessary support system throughout this journey. For believing in me and being a source of inspiration and mentor throughout this project.

- My co-supervisor Dr. M.S Mabusela for the unfailing support, guidance and for being the brain throughout this project.

- Ms. Nkhensani Maluleke, Ms. Hlengiwe R. Mhlongo and Dr. S Govender for an extra effort and an interest they took towards assisting me throughout this project.

- Further gratitude also goes to Mr S.Z Zungu, the Rector of Umfolozi TVET College, Mrs. Z.L Mngomezulu the Campus manager of Umfolozi TVET College (Mandeni Campus), Mandeni Campus Senior Lecturers and WBE champions, Mrs. PMT Mngoma the Hospitality Studies Senior Lecturer at Esikhawini Campus as well as the survey and interview participants for their valuable contributions.
DEDICATION

This dissertation is dedicated to my son Luyanda Ntuthuko Mthembu, my mother Mrs. S.K Ngubane for instilling the love of education and for funding my tertiary education taking from nowhere, as well as to my entire family and extended family for their never failing support.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Content**

- Declaration (i)
- Abstract (ii)
- Acknowledgement (iii)
- Dedication (iv)

## CHAPTER ONE: ORIENTATION TO THE PROBLEM

1.1 Introduction 1
1.2 Problem Statement 5
1.3 Delimitation of the field of study 6
1.4 Aim of the study 6
1.4.1 Objectives of the study 7
1.5 Explanation of operational concepts 7
1.5.1 Technical and Vocational Education and Training 7
1.5.2 National Curriculum (Vocational) 7
1.5.3 Workplace Based Experience 7
1.5.4 Work Integrated Learning 8
1.6 Research Methodology 8
1.6.1 Research Paradigm 8
1.6.2 Sampling Procedures 8
1.6.3 Selection of the target population 8
1.6.4 Data collection instruments 9
1.6.4.1 Quantitative data 9
1.6.4.2 Qualitative data

1.6.5 Pilot

1.6.6 Data analysis and presentation of data

1.6.7 Planning for field work

1.7 Division of chapters

1.7.1 Chapter 1

1.7.2 Chapter 2

1.7.3 Chapter 3

1.7.4 Chapter 4

1.7.5 Chapter 5

1.8 Summary

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction

2.2 Background of the study

2.3 Theoretical perspectives underpinning WBE

2.3.1 Theoretical perspectives for the study

2.3.2 Theoretical perspectives in general

2.4 The educational rationale for WBE provision

2.5 WBE in South African TVET colleges

2.6 International perspectives of WBE

2.6.1 Kenya

2.6.2 Australia

2.7 NCV curriculum structure and work based compliance

2.8 The role of TVET Colleges’ management in WBE implementation
2.8.1 Proposed steps or guidelines for compliance

2.9 Benefits of WBE for students, host employers and TVET Colleges

2.9.1 Benefits for TVET Colleges students

2.9.1.1 Creation of networks

2.9.2 Benefits for host employers or industries

2.9.3 Benefits for TVET colleges

2.10 Key consideration for organizing WBE for students

2.11 The National Skills Development Strategy 3

2.12 Challenges of WBE implementation faced by TVET colleges management

2.12.1 Assessment of Workplace Based Education

2.12.2 The challenge of assessing professional competence in WIL

2.13 Conclusion

CHAPTER THREE: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

3.1 Introduction

3.2 Research Design

3.2.1 Data collection instruments

3.2.1.1 Quantitative Data Collection

3.2.1.2 Qualitative Data Collection

3.3 Sampling procedures

3.4 Data collection procedures

3.4.1 Ethical considerations

3.5 Data management and analysis

3.6 Validity and Reliability
CHAPTER FOUR: DATA ANALYSIS AND PRESENTATION OF RESULTS

4.1 Introduction

4.2 Lecturers’ profile

4.2.1 Lecturer’s qualifications

4.2.2 Lecture/Teaching experience

4.2.3 NC (V) levels lectured by respondents

4.2.4 The role of respondents in WBE implementation

4.2.5 Location of the campuses

4.3 Discussions/Findings in line with the research questions

4.3.1 The role of college management in the effective implementation of WBE

4.3.2 Campus management support levels of WBE implementation

4.3.2.1 Availability of clear vision for WBE implementation

4.3.2.2 Enforcement of WBE strategy of the college

4.3.2.3 Developed action plans to guide the implementation of WBE

4.3.3 The role of WBE Champions in WBE implementation

4.3.4 WBE assessment as part of management’s role in implementation

4.3.5 Communication between relevant stakeholders

4.3.5.1 Maintaining strong ties with the host employers

4.3.5.2 Reviving the Campus Indaba committee

4.3.6 Informing students about available WBE opportunities

4.3.7 WBE budget as an integral part in implementation and compliance
4.3.8 Integration of WBE in the NC (V) curriculum to ensure compliance  
4.4 Awareness of policies behind WBE implementation  
4.4.1 Role players’ awareness of WBE policies  
4.4.2 The significance of WBE training  
4.5 Challenges in the implementation process  
4.5.1 The challenge of budget constraints to implement WBE  
4.5.2 The challenge of the shortage of host employers for a WBE programme  
4.5.3 NCV curriculum critique by industries or host employers  
4.5.4 Challenges hindering WBE Implementation  
4.6 Conclusion

CHAPTER 5: SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 Introduction  
5.2 Summary of findings  
5.2.1 The role of the college management in the implementation of WBE  
5.2.2 College management awareness of policies behind WBE implementation  
5.2.3 Setbacks encountered in implementation of and compliance with WBE  
5.3 Discussion of findings in connection with research topic  
5.4 Limitations of the study  
5.5 Conclusion  
5.6 Recommendations  
5.6.1 Recommendations related to the study  
5.6.2 Recommendations for the study
REFERENCES 94

FIGURES
Figure 4.2.1 Lecturers’ Qualifications 57
Figure 4.2.2 Respondents years of lecturing/Industry related experience 58
Figure 4.2.3 Levels lectured by the respondents 59
Figure 4.2.4 Participants role in WBE implementation 60
Figure 4.2.5 Location of campuses 61
Figure 4.3.2 Campus management support of WBE 62
Figure 4.3.3 Role of WBE champions in the implementation process 65
Figure 4.3.4 WBE assessment as part of management's role 67
Figure 4.3.5 Communication between relevant stakeholders 69
Figure 4.3.7 Proper budget planning for WBE 72
Figure 4.3.8 Integration of WBE in the NCV curriculum 74
Figure 4.4.1 Awareness of WBE policies and implementation strategies 75

ANNEXURES
ANNEXURE A: Application to conduct research 104
ANNEXURE B: A letter of permission to conduct research 107
ANNEXURE C: Questionnaire 109
ANNEXURE D: Interview Schedule 117
ANNEXURE E: Standard Ethics Protocol 121
ANNEXURE F: Informed Consent Declaration 123
ANNEXURE G: Ethical Clearance Certificate 127
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CHE</td>
<td>Council of Higher Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DHET</td>
<td>Department of Higher Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FET</td>
<td>Further Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GoK</td>
<td>Government of Kenya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KESSP</td>
<td>Kenya’s Education Sector Support Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDG</td>
<td>Millennium Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCV</td>
<td>National Certificate Vocational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDP</td>
<td>National Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSDS</td>
<td>National Skills Development Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PIVOTAL</td>
<td>Professional, Vocational, Technical and Academic Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPE</td>
<td>Personal Protective Equipment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PQM</td>
<td>Programme Qualification Mix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAQA</td>
<td>South African Qualification Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SETA</td>
<td>Sector Education and training Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SSACI</td>
<td>Swiss South Africa Cooperative Initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SSS</td>
<td>Student Support Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVET</td>
<td>Technical and Vocational Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WBE</td>
<td>Workplace Based Experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WIL</td>
<td>Work Integrated Learning</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1

ORIENTATION TO THE PROBLEM

1.1 INTRODUCTION

Perold, Cloete and Papier (2012) affirm that in South Africa it has been estimated that (50%) of the population is under the age of 25. This is a clear indication that here youth matters, based on the statistics records above. Therefore, it is assumed that high quality, relevant education and training strongly influences the chances young people have in their lives. However, in 2010 “approximately 1.6 million students were enrolled in South African universities and further education and training colleges (FET colleges) while twice as many young people (3.2 million) were ‘NEET’ meaning they were Not in Education, Employment or Training” (Department of Higher Education and Training, 2012:11). Basing an argument on the statistics above, the future looks uninviting when one considers the fact that more than 51% of South Africa’s young people are unemployed as is evident in the survey conducted by the SA Institute of Race Relations, 28 July 2011 (DHET, 2012). This alarming scenario has not improved significantly in the last couple of years.

Furthermore, “one of the causes of youth unemployment that has been identified on the supply side of the labour market is a lack of appropriate skills and work-related capabilities including a lack of prior work experience” (Smith, 2011:10). Although TVET sector has undergone several transformation cycles post 1994, a mechanism for TVET college students to gain relevant workplace experience has, with some exceptions not yet been established (DHET, 2012).

In a speech given at the Pan African TVET and FET Conference, Minister of Education, Naledi Pandor stated that:

“Vocational education sits at the centre of skills development is clear-how we design and deliver it is less clear. The best way to teach vocational education is widely debated. The challenge of how best to link conceptual knowledge and workplace experience continues to plague TVET sector” (Pandor, 2008).
The TVET strategy as put about in (UNESCO, 2014) intends to strengthen capacities and focus in the sector, on how to transform and expand TVET to ensure that all young people and adults can build on the analysis of the prominent policy areas. Six persisting challenges are hoped to be addressed by the UNESCO which are:

1. Promoting skills development for youth employment
2. Ensuring access: TVET for all
3. Improving the image and quality of the TVET sector
4. Financing TVET sector
5. Strengthening innovation and research into the sector and
6. Advancing sustainable development.

Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) institutions, commonly known as Further Education and Training (FET) colleges, are mandated to lead students to acquire the practical or technical skills and understanding that are necessary for employment in a particular occupation, trade or group of occupations (Atchoerena & Delluc, 2001). Malale and Sentsho (2014) posit that TVET College sectors were transformed with the intention of responding to the skills demand of the South African economy. This is one of the mandates of TVET colleges, hence the name change from FET to TVET colleges. Another mandate of the TVET colleges as highlighted by the (UNESCO, 2004), is to furnish skills which are required to improve productivity, raise income levels and improve access to employment opportunities. Furthermore, the DHET had also realised that lack of proper training and real life work exposure was a great hindrance to access job opportunities in South Africa (Malale & Sentsho, 2014). TVET curriculum touches base with skills development which include a broad range of core skills so that the students with TVET qualifications are well equipped for productive activities and employment opportunities (Nyerere, 2009).

In terms of the purpose of this study, it is important to offer a brief reflection on the rationale behind the name-change from FET colleges to TVET colleges. TVET means “aspects of the education process, involving, in addition to general education, the study of technologies and related sciences, and the acquisition of practical skills, attitudes, understanding and knowledge relating to occupations in various sectors of economic life” (UNESCO, 2004:22).
TVET curriculum is shaped in such a way that it has three pillars: theory, which is done in a classroom setup, and is institutionally based; the practical component, which supports the theory in the form of simulations, practical demonstrations and assigned tasks done in a classroom or in a practicum room; and the third component, which is workplace-based experience (Swiss South Africa Cooperative Initiative (SSACI, 2010). This component has many benefits for the student, and inter alia, enables students to acquire vocational skills and knowledge in a real-life environment (Moll, Steinberg & Broekman, 2005).

In order for WBE to yield the results it was originally set out to, it ought to be managed effectively. Therefore the onus rests on the college management to buy into the programme fully, for successful implementation and the funding that will be needed, as well as to maintain partnerships with industries and host employers (SSACI, 2012). Effective management of WBE includes development of the WBE strategy, development of action plans to guide the implementation of WBE per college/campus as well as per programme. Management of WBE also include the monitoring of WBE activities in line with the developed action plans, reporting on information and review and evaluation of WBE success (SSACI, 2012).

The Department of Higher Education and Training (DHET), along with the institutions it is responsible for, is located at the nexus between the formal education system and the workplace (DHET, 2012). It is therefore DHET’s responsibility to ensure that those entering the labour market are qualified and competent to take up the employment and income generating opportunities that exist, and that will exist as the economy grows and changes in the future. Workplace Based Experience (WBE) comes into place as a result of this responsibility.

There are some noticeable achievements in the TVET sector, since its inception in 2007 which include among others: “restructuring of the TVET system, recapitalisation, policies on norms and standards for funding, some progress on the curriculum, the introduction of a bursary scheme, a national plan and lecturer qualification framework” (Gewer, 2010:30).

The available information indicates that there is a very poor return for this investment to date. The success of NCV is regarded as “generally poor, as demonstrated by the 4% throughput rate of the 2007 cohort which completed the qualification in 2009” (DHET, 2012:22).
above that, there is a concern that the content of the NCV does not accurately align with skills requirements in the industries concerned.

The general feedback from industry is that the NCV provides a general grounding which must be further developed in the workplace setup in order to develop the necessary occupation (DHET, 2012). It is due to this view by industries that a need for WBE was necessitated. Therefore, compliance is vital to realise the dream of the industry as a partner and a stakeholder.

By 2030, South Africa ought to have a post-school education system that provides a range of accessible alternatives for young people (DHET, 2013). In doing so, DHET must provide a diversified mix of programmes which will significantly benefit the poor, as largely poor learners who struggle to complete their schooling, who drop out of college especially TVET colleges, who do not achieve university entrance, and whose poor skills base make it difficult for them to secure employment. Vision 2030 has a lot to do with (National Development Plan, 2011) ensuring that “there will be at least one institution offering TVET programmes in every district in the country” (DHET, 2013:40).

A study of best practice in WIL according to Orrell, (2011:34) “recognises three essential elements-institutional, educational and partnership in order for successful implementation to take place. At an institutional level, a clearly articulated and shared vision of WIL within the institution, including a shared understanding of its purposes and expectations, is necessary. Educational elements require support and integration in curriculum development and institutional strategic plans”

Furthermore, Orrell, (2011:34), states that “the partnership elements which has a lot to do with developing robust and mature relationships between institutions of learning and placement providers and ensure that both college and host-organisation supervisory staff are provided with activities to develop their leadership capabilities. The study concluded that there is a need
for scholarship on leadership or specifically for role players in WBE/WIL implementation and management at higher institutional levels”.

Findings in the ‘Understanding the Impact of Practice Based Learning Exchange’ project reconfirmed a number of existing perspectives around WIL/WBE leadership as (Patrick, Peach, Pocknee, Webb, Fletcher, & Prett, 2009) view them.

This project reconfirmed the critical importance of strong leadership in WBE in achieving good WBE outcomes in the sectors; the power of an integrated whole-of-organisation approach as well as the barriers that need to be embarked upon in the implementation of WBE in both industry and educational sectors.

In order to promote WBE, the Swiss South African Cooperation Initiative (SSACI), based in Johannesburg is a public-private partnership between the SWISS Government and a group of Swiss companies operating in South Africa (SSACI, 2010). SSACI reviewed the youth unemployment crisis in an effort to assist in its alleviation, now focuses on strengthening the interface between the TVET college sector and industry by introducing workplace experience for students currently enrolled in the TVET colleges as well as TVET colleges’ graduates.

SSACI introduced WBE to FET College students on the National Certificate (Vocational) (NCV) programmes in a pilot project initiated in 2008. The intention of WBE is to develop long term cooperation between colleges and companies and in so doing improve the delivery of the NCV programme according to the needs of the industry. During short on-course (1-3 weeks) “students observe and experience the world of work and acquire a valuable contextual foundation. This is a way to encourage TVET colleges and companies to talk to each other and to improve student employability in the long term” (SSACI, 2010:11).

1.2 PROBLEM STATEMENT

WBE is one of the components in the NCV curriculum structure, which is of fundamental importance in ensuring that students are thoroughly prepared for a better fit in the world of work (National Development Plan, 2011). In some TVET programmes, students cannot exit
the programme without certain assessments from work-based components of the programme. This study therefore seeks to explore the level of compliance with the NCV curriculum structure in offering WBE for students, as set out in the SSACI initiative (SSACI, 2010) and the National Strategy. According to the National Skills Development Strategy III (DHET, 2013), every student who graduates from the TVET colleges must have received some kind of WBE exposure. If this component is ignored, students can be robbed of an opportunity to learn and improve their employability chances.

This study seeks to answer the following main research questions:
Does the TVET colleges’ NCV curriculum structure comply with the national strategy and policy stipulations in offering WBE for students?

This study seeks to answer the following sub-research questions.
1. Is the college management aware of the National strategy and SSACI initiative as the initiative in place for implementation of WBE in TVET colleges?
2. What is the role of the college management in ensuring compliance with the vocational curriculum structure in offering WBE for students?
3. What are the challenges the TVET colleges’ management encounter when they have to implement the third component of the NCV curriculum structure?

1.3 DELIMITATION OF THE FIELD OF STUDY

In Kwa-Zulu Natal (KZN) province, there is a total of nine TVET colleges. The study is only limited to KZN province, and the researcher chose Umfolozi TVET College and earmarked two NCV campuses and one for a pilot study, as the field of study. As two campuses were chosen, campus management as well WBE champions or officers representing each NCV programmes formed part of the case study.

1.4 AIM OF THE STUDY

The main aim of this study was to determine whether the TVET colleges’ NCV curriculum structure complied with the national strategy and policy stipulations in offering WBE for students.
1.4.1 **OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY**

1. To determine college management awareness of the National strategy and SSACI initiative for WBE implementation in the TVET college.
2. To determine the role of college management teams in ensuring compliance with the vocational curriculum structure offering WBE for students.
3. To identify the challenges encountered by the TVET colleges’ management in ensuring compliance with the National strategy and SSACI initiative.

1.5 **EXPLANATION OF OPERATIONAL CONCEPTS**

1.5.1 **Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET)** is defined by UNESCO as those aspects of the educational process involving, in addition to general education, the study of technologies and related sciences and the acquisition of practical skills, attitudes, understanding and knowledge relating to occupations in various sectors of economic life (UNESCO, 2014). TVET, thus equips people not only with vocational skills but also with a broad range of knowledge, skills and attitudes that are now recognised as indispensable for meaningful participation in work and life.

1.5.2 **National Curriculum (Vocational), NCV** was introduced in 2006, a new curriculum and qualification framework was developed, aimed at addressing quality and relevant shortcomings in the college curriculum. The NCV is focused priority on skills for the economy and there are currently 14 subfields within the NCV qualification (Gewer, 2010).

1.5.3 **Workplace Based Experience (WBE)** is a short period of structured workplace learning (typically 5-15 days) in a real-world workplace, as part of the institution-based programme of study (SSACI, 2010). It is aimed at developing basic job competence through the application in the workplace of knowledge and skills acquired in the college. This kind of an experience takes place in a real workplace rather than a simulated one (hence the phrase ‘workplace-based’); however if a real workplace cannot be found to provide the
WBE, a simulated workplace can be used if the work done complies with certain criteria and requirements (SSACI, 2010).

1.5.4 Work Integrated Learning (WIL) was defined by UNESCO (2014:19) “Is an umbrella term for any purposefully designed learning programme that integrates theoretical knowledge with authentic practice in the workplace” In another development, Shicore, Kate, Nichola & Daniel (2013) describe WIL as an umbrella term used for a range of approaches that integrate theory with the practice of work within a purposefully designed curriculum.

WIL is synonymous and used interchangeably with the following concepts: experiential learning (EL) (Wessels, 2005; Zegwaard & McCurdy, 2014), workplace-based learning (McEwen & Trede, 2014), cooperative education (Engelbrecht, 2003), practice-based learning (Cannan, 2008), work-based teaching (Williams, 2010).

1.6 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

1.6.1 Research Paradigm
According to Cohen, Manion & Morrison (2001:249), “a research design is used to describe the process for conducting a study, and its purpose, which is to help find appropriate answers to the research questions”. MacMillan & Schumacher (1993) view research design as” the plan and structure of investigation used to obtain evidence to answer research questions. This study uses mixed methods to collect both quantitative and qualitative data”

1.6.2 Sampling Procedures
The research targets the population of campus management and WBE champions in different programmes in the NCV Campuses of the TVET College. The sample of 21 lecturing staff is identified as respondents of this study by utilising the purposive sampling.

According to Cohen, et al. (2001) purposive sampling is a sampling technique where participants are chosen because of some defining characteristics that make them the holders of the data needed for the study. Campus managers from two campuses of Umfolozi TVET College, senior lecturers and WBE champions are believed to possess the richest possible source of information to answer the research questions.

1.6.3 Selection of the target population
The study targeted 21 participants ranging from campus managers, senior lecturers of different programmes (one in each programme), and a maximum of five programmes on two campuses, depending on the NCV programmes offered by each campus as well as WBE champions per NCV programme on each campus. The sample was conducted in one public TVET College in Northern KwaZulu-Natal province, which comprised of five campuses responsible for NCV levels 2-4.

1.6.4 Data collection instruments

1.6.4.1 Quantitative data
A questionnaire with closed-ended questions, based on the college/campus management awareness of the National strategy and SSACI project initiative for implementing WBE in TVET colleges as well as the role of the college/campus management in ensuring compliance with the vocational curriculum structure for WBE implementation, was used to implore the above views of the campus management.

1.6.4.2 Qualitative data
In accordance with Cohen, et al. (2007:135), “open-ended questions of the questionnaire are used for qualitative investigation, because they provide rich and personal data, possible answers are unknown, and it is exploratory and appropriate to solicit participants' views”. Sharma (1990) asserts that “qualitative data usually involves direct interaction with individuals on a one-to-one basis, or in a group setting”. Structured interviews were also used to collect data on the challenges the TVET colleges’ management encounter in practically implementing the third component of the NCV curriculum structure.

1.6.5 Pilot

For the purpose of this study, a pilot study was used to test the validity of the instrument by giving it to a small group of participants from the intended population (Sharma, 1990:173). It enabled the researcher to modify the instrument before sending it to the actual respondents. During the pilot study one campus was targeted (one campus manager, two senior lecturers and four WBE champions), assisted a great deal in refining and modifying the research instrument
in the following aspect: Refining the instrument by eliminating ambiguity in the questions, a lot of questions were to be re-phrased, and in modifying the instrument, there was a need for a structured one-on-one interview to be utilized for open-ended question which was initially to be a questionnaire. A major reason of modifying an instrument was the respondents felt there is a lot they wished to say, which cannot be covered in the few lines provided for them to respond. The interviews would consume a lot of time but it was ideal that the researcher went for them in order to solicit views of the respondents effectively and capture every detail.

1.6.6 Data analysis and presentation of data

The entire process of data analysis started immediately after data were collected and tabulated and interviews transcribed. The presentation of data was done in a form of graphs. Concerning the interviews, transcriptions were also counted to ascertain that all have been received and they were coded as well and carefully analysed, paying particular attention to the actual words used, emotions displayed and the person behind the uttered words. Mostly verbatim statements were quoted and analysed. Miles & Huberman (1994:10-11) define data analysis as “consisting of three flows of activity that take place at the same time: data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing and verification”.

1.6.7 Planning for field work

- The study used a case study. The following procedure was followed.
- A letter was sent to the college principal of a TVET college, requesting for a permission to conduct research in northern KwaZulu-Natal.
- Copies of the approval letter from the college principal, participants’ consent forms, standard ethics protocol form as well as the participant informed consent declaration accompanied each questionnaire and interview procedures.

1.7 DIVISION OF CHAPTERS

This study has five chapters, which are organised as follows:

1.7.1 Chapter 1- Orientation
This chapter comprises the outline of the study as a whole: the motivation for the study, the problem statement, aim and objectives, definition of operational concepts, and the research methodology.

1.7.2 Chapter 2- Literature Review
This chapter provides the literature review which covers the theoretical framework of the study. The literature gives an insight on the provision of WBE for TVET students, and compliance thereof as stipulated in the NCV curriculum

1.7.3 Chapter 3- Research Design and Methodology
This chapter delivers the method of survey that was used to collect data from the respondents on the level of compliance to a policy in providing WBE for students.

1.7.4 Chapter 4- Data Analysis and Presentation
This chapter encompasses the presentation of actual field work, and the analysis and interpretation of data collected.

1.7.5 Chapter 5- Summary, Conclusions and Recommendations
This chapter offers an overview of the findings of the study, conclusions and suggested recommendations.

1.8 SUMMARY
This chapter succinctly introduced the field of study; research problem contextualised in this chapter; delimitation of the field of study, the aim, objectives, research questions and explanation of operational concepts.
The next chapter presents the review of the related literature to the study.
CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter portrays a critical review of literature on the compliance levels of the Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) curriculum structure in ensuring that Workplace Based Experience (WBE) is offered to students before they exit the college. This is mostly due to the fact that TVET colleges in many parts of the world face the ever-increasing demand of furnishing the graduates with necessary skills for them to be employable.

This is one of the reasons WBE is considered as one component to enhance TVET graduates employability levels. Jackson (2013) is of the view that if WBE programmes are effectively implemented, can build student’s confidence and improve their appreciation of the importance of employability skills as well as provide a valuable orientation to the world of work”.

The underlying intent of TVET curriculum is that students should acquire skills which they can use to earn a living and simultaneously contribute to development (Kigwilu & Githinji, 2015). “Not all students study in order to be employees. Some would like to create jobs and become employers” (Malale & Sentsho, 2014: 684), TVET work placement must assist “students acquire practical experience and skills that will help them to venture in their own businesses and create job opportunities”. This implies that if WBE is well managed and effectively implemented, can yield desired results for its beneficiaries, which in this case, refers to all stakeholders involved in WBE.

The theoretical perspectives established through review of literature captures the intellectual underpinnings of WBE perspective on learning and development. This study explored the works of the following theorists which form the basis of this study: Kolb’s theory of experiential learning, Biggs’s constructive alignment theory as well as Dewey’s theory of reflection.

The rationale behind the name change from Further Education and Training institutions to TVET institutions will be briefly explored in keeping with the discussion in chapter 1. WBE must also be seen in light of the new National Skills Development Strategy 3 (DHET, 2010:6)
wherein the government has indicated its seriousness about WBE programmes in educational institutions, TVET sector inclusive, by launching the ‘Professional, Vocational, Technical and Academic Learning’ (PIVOTAL) programmes that aim to simplify students’ workplace experience and establishing the new Directorate of Work Integrated Learning (WIL), which resides under the Ministry of Education.

Moreover, the TVET curriculum which is offered in two core-curricular which are general vocational and occupational qualifications will be elaborated upon but for the purpose of this study, the main focus will be only on general vocational curriculum offered through the National Certificate Vocational (NCV).

A critical synthesis of literature also gave rise to the necessary podium for conducting the in-depth synthesis of the role of the College management in ensuring compliance with the vocational curriculum in implementing WBE for NCV students, the capabilities they should possess as well as step by step approach (SSACI, 2010) to be followed to ascertain compliance.

In chapter 1, it is put about clearly that WBE is the third component of the general vocational curriculum in the NCV (DHET, 2013). WBE is defined and its role is stated. The policy, legislation and project behind WBE implementation in South African context which is NSDS 3, the Skills Development Act as well as SSACI project will be discussed in depth in order to form the basis or rather use them as a benchmark to deduce the compliance levels (DHET, 2013; SSACI, 2012 & Act No.97 of 1998).

In addition to that, the cited challenges encountered by the college management in implementing WBE effectively will be discussed and the possible solutions be recommended. The latter will be done by employing the best practices from other institutions with success stories in the WBE implementation.

2.2 BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY

The education system in South Africa has been undergoing transformation since the foundation of democracy in 1994. The Further Education and Training (FET) sector, now termed TVET
sector came about due to that transformation. This implies that the TVET sector is new in the education sector, therefore there is not much already researched in this sector, unlike the Basic Education, hence a new programme came into existence in this sector which is the National Certificate Vocational (NCV), as a result of this transformation.

The purpose of NCV “is to respond to the national crisis of lack of skills and the ever-increasing demand by the South African government to combat that problem facing the South African economy” (DHET, 2013:12).

The main responsibility of the TVET sector through the colleges is “none other than education and training for the workplace, thus equipping the TVET graduates with the necessary skills to better fit in the world of work and consequently be employable. In order to achieve that, the onus rests entirely on the TVET colleges to ascertain that the students experience the workplace before their completion of studies through offering WBE as a component in the NCV curriculum structure” (SSACI, 2012: 23).

DHET recognised that lack of students’ experiences to the real work environment is a major burden for students in accessing employment opportunities (Mopani South East TVET College, 2012:7). This implies that if the challenge is not addressed, South Africa may continue facing the problem of a huge number of unemployed graduates. This was further reconfirmed by the Minister of Higher Education and Training Dr Blade Nzimande, in his keynote address at the launch of quality council for trades and occupations, at the Northern Cape Urban TVET College in 2010 when he said:

“We know how that college training is, on its own not enough, if work training does not complement the learning done at colleges, we could well find that the young stars work so hard to train remain unemployed after they qualify” (SSACI Swiss South African Cooperation Initiative, 2012:5).

Due to the lack of intensive research in the TVET sector, the Department of Higher Education and Training involved the Swiss South African Initiative (SSACI) in a project to assist in effective facilitation of the workplace placement of FET/TVET college students, which till to date is used as a guide for WBE implementation in TVET colleges. The fundamental purpose
of this project is “to help the TVET colleges to align the NCV programme with the needs of the industry and whilst doing that ensure sustainable college-industry partnership” (SSACI, 2012:8). Furthermore it has been stated that “working hand-in-glove with the Department of Higher Education and Training, SSACI facilitates the placement of students with employers, which was aimed at 70% target of placing students by 2014” (DHET, 2013: 33).

Furthermore, the importance of WBE will be highlighted by employing the benefits it yields for several stakeholders involved in this component. As theory and practical are assessed, so WBE as part of the NCV curriculum structure component must be assessed as well. In addition to that, a brief account on WBE assessment will be given and some challenges mostly in assessing professional competences will be highlighted and solutions be given.

2.3 Theoretical perspectives underpinning WBE

“Tell me, and I forget. Teach me and I remember. Involve me and I learn” Confucius, 450 B.C.

This is the most used quotation that speak to the importance of necessitating learning by doing, which has a lot to do with ensuring that there is an effective connection between college life and working life. This implies that theory and practical knowledge alone is not enough to ensure that students are employable after graduating from the TVET sector, but being actively exposed to the workplace environment can assist to ascertain that they are easily employable.

2.3.1 Theoretical perspectives for the study

This Study can be traced to the contribution of experiential learning that can be traced back to Experiential Learning Theory of John Dewey, Jean Piaget and David Kolb who are regarded as the pioneers of this theory. Dewey (1938) asserts the idea of people learning by doing or active involvement and that all genuine education can be achieved through experience hence the term Workplace-Based Experience. Therefore, for Dewey, knowledge is a collaboration of the person with the environment or other, which has a lot to do with the way the person, interacts with the environment around.

In the process, an individual person is actively engaged in predicting and controlling his future experience, adds (Sidorsky, 1977). Workplace experience can further be explained by Piaget’s process of adaptation, which consists of assimilation and accommodation. Assimilation being the process by which a person takes information from the environment into his or her mind and accommodation being the difference made to the persons’ mind by the process of assimilation (Satterly, 1987).
Kolb (1984:38) defines experiential learning as the “process whereby knowledge is created through the transformation of experience”.

He further emphasises the importance of the following four critical aspects of the learning process as viewed from an experiential perspective which are “the emphasis in the process of adaptation and learning, knowledge is a transformation process which is continuously created and recreated through experience, learning transforms experience in both its objectives and subjective forms as well as to understand the nature of knowledge and vice versa.

Kolb developed The Experiential Learning model, where learning is composed of four elements or stages” (Tennant, 2006; Malale & Sentsho, 2014). The elements or stages are; “concrete experience, reflective observation, abstract conceptualisation and active experimentation. In order for learning to be effective, the educator should take each learner around each element or stage and ensure that links are made between each element or stage. Learning can start around each stage. When starting with concrete experience, the information that serves as a basis for reflection is provided. Through reflections the information is assimilated to form abstract concepts. The concepts are used to develop new theories about the world. The theories are then tested. This model of learning can be used in various types of education setting including vocational and general education” (Tennant, 2006; Dochy, Gijbels, Segers & Van den Bosche 2011; Malale & Sentsho, 2014, Cherry, 2014).

Kolb (1984) experiential learning cycle seems to indicate that students will be actively involved in the learning process. Within the South African context, the effectiveness of this engagement becomes evident when applied (as stated by RSA SAQA, 2001:11) as a combination of practical, foundational and reflexive competence. These competencies are described by (RSA SAQA, 2001:11) as practical competence which is the demonstrated ability to perform a set of tasks and actions in authentic situations.

This further indicates the importance of affording students an opportunity to learn in a workplace environment in order to gain hands-on-experience. Biggs and Tang (2007:22-25) further states that for effective applied competence in the TVET sector, there is a need for deep learning as compared to surface learning. Kolb (1984) pointed out that experience is of fundamental importance in effective teaching and learning. Biggs and Tang (2007:22-25) describe:
“Surface learning as skating along the surface of the learning content by using low, cognitive-level activities when higher-level activities are required to do the task properly”.

Deep learning, by contrast, “is about engaging the task appropriately and meaningfully through the use of appropriate cognitive activities”.

Therefore, learning is all about wanting to know more about underlying meanings, ideas and successful application in order to see and understand the bigger picture.

This implies that deep learning must be emphasised in the TVET curriculum in order to ensure that students get deeper understanding of the workplace operations. Furthermore, students will also acquire knowledge and skill required for the competency of the programme.

In his recent work, Ryan (2011) takes this further by proposing that “reflection includes making sense of the past experiences as well as re-imagining future experience”. Schatzi (1996) believes that practices are performed and comprehended through shared sayings and doings directed towards achieving specific, pre-set ends. This approach as Schatzi (1996) puts it “is consistent with students by undertaking WBE work placements where they are orientated into a new learning context or ‘world’ as they learn by doings and sayings that enable them to undertake performance of workplace practices”.

2.3.2 Theoretical perspectives in general

Kolb (1984) points out that while experience is part of learning but it is not on its own, an adequate condition for learning. Therefore, it goes without saying that for authentic learning to occur at deeper levels, education needs to be rooted and grounded in experience, and that experience must be coupled by the students’ active reflection on the experience obtained.

The constructionist approach has a lot to do with humans building knowledge and meaning from an interaction between their own experiences and their ideas. Therefore, it is apparent that the dominant approach to comprehending experience in adult education has revolved around cognitive reflection upon the experience which is concrete rather than abstract (Kolb et al, 2000). Hargreaves (2001) argues that education should initiate youth into intellectual and moral outcomes in order for them to make sound intellectual and moral judgement and choices.
There are variety of ways which have been developed over the years by educators to enhance the process of experiential learning by facilitating students’ critical reflection on experience, by prompting holistic experiences in instructional settings, coaching and mentoring in the midst of experience and lastly by assessment of the experience (Cherry, 2014). The reflective constructivist view of WBE perspectives indicates that learning is directly linked to the individual and collective human actions and interactions (Cherry, 2014).

Biggs (1999) believes that “for any meaningful learning to occur, students need to observe and reflect on their experiences and then apply and test the concepts learnt through experience.” Donald (1983) “points out the importance of reflection and reflective practice in the education of professionals. Therefore, in order to bridge the gap between theory and practical effectively, WBE must be integrated into the theory for students to reach a better understanding of the theoretical knowledge they have acquired”. In addition to that (Knight, 1996 & Sen, 2010) speculate that “while WBE can be comprehended and practised in many ways in WIL curricular, reflection is an action, which is an after-the-fact, cognitive process as the put it.”

Dewey (1910:6) “defines reflection as ‘active persistent and careful consideration of any belief or supposed form of knowledge in the light of the grounds that support it and further conclusion which it tends “. Boud (1999) adapts Dewey’s definition, but further include experience, and not just thought as comprising the reflective domain.

Drawing from Bouds’ view of reflection, it is apparent that reflection is about student’s processing their experience in different ways by exploring their understanding of what they are doing and why they are doing it and impact it has on others (Boud, 1999).

Dreyfus & Dreyfus (2005) present a five-stage phenomenological method of skills acquisition, in which they underline the importance of spontaneous judgement in learning practices. These stages are: novice stage, advanced beginner stage, competence stage, proficiency stage and lastly the expertise stage. Each stage will be explained briefly and its link to the WBE in TVET Colleges is highlighted.

1. **Novice stage**
Yanow & Tsoukas (2009) state that in this stage, the students, though they understand how the practice works, as they already possess some theoretical knowledge and practical knowledge but they lack contextual knowledge of how the practice works. The instructor simplify the working environment for the student and gives the student specific rules to follow, which if followed assist the student to master the working environment.

2. **Advance beginner stage**

In this stage, the student begins to develop understanding of the workplace context alone or with an instructors’ assistance. In this stage, workplace learning is still isolated and analytic (Dreyfus & Dreyfus, 2005:784).

3. **Competence stage**

In this stage, the students recognise vast number of elements and procedures, though missing a sense of what is important in a particular situation.

This is the stage of uncertainty, which calls for the student to experiment. In order for the student to cope in this stage, there is a need for a developed plan of action and limitation to a number of relevant features. This can be successfully done through instruction or experience. In this stage, confusion is anticipatable. If emotional involvement is absent, a trainee student may withdraw and become disconnected and disinterested. That is when the instructor will play a meaningful role to intervene and assist the trainee as (Dreyfus & Dreyfus, 2005: 784) put it. This implies that, it is therefore of fundamental importance to have instructors receiving adequate training and full understanding of their role in giving support to the trainees.

4. **Proficiency stage**

In this stage, the disinterestedness of the trainee is replaced by involvement and commitment, which means that emotional commitment, underpins successful choices and prevents unsuccessful ones’. Action becomes less stressful and easier for the trainee, as the student sees what to be done. Dreyfus & Dreyfus (2005:786) suggest that the ability to discriminate and select certain actions which are important in particular situations is mostly obvious in this stage.
In this stage as Dreyfus & Dreyfus (2005: 786) suggest, there are noticeable ability of the novice to differentiate and select certain actions which are important in certain situations, is obvious in the proficiency stage. This is mostly caused by the fact that the novice in this stage is more involved and committed. In the previous stage, students do not have a sense of what is vital in a particular given situation.

5. **Expertise stage**

In this stage, the ability to make refined distinctions distinguish the expert, who operates intuitively in each situational response (Dreyfus & Dreyfus, 2005: 787). This implies that the onus rests entirely on the practitioner who recognises what to be done and further makes decision on how to do it.

In all these stages, the role played by the instructor to assist the trainee hence the importance of workplace based education. The progression from the novice to the expertise stage is an indicative of the level of growth and involvement of the trainee, as the trainee learns contexts of the workplace being assisted by the instructor who is well trained and experienced to train the student (Dreyfus & Dreyfus, 2005).

### 2.4 The Educational Rationale for WBE Provision

The educational rationale for the provision of WBE via the TVET college curriculum will answer to the ‘why’ question with regards to WBE. Firstly, it would contribute to the fulfilment of the goals of the NSDS 3 to “promote the growth of an FET College system that is responsive to sector, local, regional, and national skills needs and priorities” (DHET, 2013:9). The rationale is underpinned by the stipulation of re-skilling and up-skilling lecturers to support the new approaches and programmes of increasing the throughput by means of appropriate academic support programmes for underprepared students. This could be beneficial to the status of the colleges and their ability to deliver WBE (SSACI, 2012).

The WBE seems to fall short in terms of achieving its original mandate and the reasons have to do with the dynamic nature of workplaces, partly due to the ever-changing and advancing technology in the workplace. Some of the reasons can be attributed to the demands set out by employers of high level technical skills (CHE, 2011). Young & Blanco (2008) touch on “differences between theoretical academic knowledge and contextualised workplace knowledge plus the difficulty in creating meaningful articulation between them particularly
when the difference between the knowledge forms and structures are poorly understood by both lecturers in the TVET colleges and workplaces”. Kigwilu & Githinji (2015) argue that “some challenges that are experienced by most TVET colleges range from an inflexible and antiquated curriculum which can be a mismatch between skills taught and those demanded by industries and low participation of the private sector in bridging the school-work gap”.

In addition to that, what should be borne in mind is the fact that WBE is NOT a replacement for practical and simulated training in the NCV curriculum structure. It also does not have anything to do with the exit placements of graduates however it yields many benefits for students in particular and the employers in general (SSACI, 2011).

Huang, Hwang and Chang (2010) assert that a qualification can open doors, but without a rich learning experience underpinning that qualification, there is a little likelihood of changing lives, release potential of students and transform societies. Gewer (2010) points out that the TVET sector lacks the competence and reliability to engage with industry on equal terms in order for the sector to afford students an opportunity for WBE exposure.

In Asia and the Pacific it has been argued (Pavlova, 2014) that “high performance in increasingly competitive global economy combined with the need to address challenges posed by climate change and carbon emissions, environmental degradation and pollution, health and poverty, require successful countries to adapt innovation-driven strategies for growth that should be supported by TVET colleges”. So TVET is viewed as a tool for productivity enhancement and poverty reduction strategies.

Given the context, there is still a twinkle on the side of employers who look to TVET graduates to provide them with focused employees who are able to work flexibly in specialised industries and who are able to communicate well with both clients and fellow workers. The TVET colleges in South Africa have come under tremendous pressure for failing to provide sufficient numbers of highly qualified graduates who are skilled in this way for the economy (UNESCO, 2014).

Moll, Steinberg & Broekman (2005) point out that the ‘supply-driven model’ of TVET poses danger to the institution. The supply-driven model, if not well structured and properly planned, can give rise to an over-supply of college graduates with the same skills and knowledge. Furthermore, the inability of students to apply the theory they learned in practice is like
acquisition of tacit skills. In essence, Moll, et al. (2005:27) assert that “many graduates in South Africa are only able to try to apply the knowledge once they get into a job market”. If these challenges experienced by TVET graduates are not tackled by the TVET curriculum structure, the following consequences are inevitable. One of the consequences is that, firstly there is an absence of formal way or a well-structured way of linking knowledge in the TVET College to application in the workplace. This will mean that employees will have to invest huge amounts of money in providing initial training to the new employees. Secondly, the theory taught in TVET colleges seems to fail to keep up with the changes in the workplace and finally, young adults exiting the TVET sector will find it extremely difficult to obtain job opportunities (Moll et al, 2005).

The above also adds to the challenge facing young people when making decisions about their careers. Consequently, the skills and knowledge produced through the TVET sector have not kept up with the realities of the workplace. That is when WBE implementation comes into shape because without the ability to apply what they learned in practice, there are large numbers of young graduates coming out of the TVET colleges with general skills and knowledge which are not necessary in high demand (Moll et al, 2005).

The supply-driven model means that all the colleges offer employers the same, non-specific skills and knowledge. The system leads to a situation in which there is little opportunity for any one college graduate to offer the employer something different from another (DHET, 2013).

The challenge in any country is the extent to which the learning and career choices made by the young people are responsive to the demands of the labour market. Labour market demands are those arising from employers’ expectations of their workforce. These should be made possible by the TVET curriculum, to match with the expectations of the students as well. Vuoskoski & Poikela (2015) posit that “one of the challenges exposed to higher education institutions is the need to provide educational and pedagogical environments that are relevant to the demands of the nature and organisation of contemporary work and work environment.” However TVET colleges if they are to be responsive in this environment must ensure that they train young people in the skills that are in demand in the current economic situation. In other words, TVET must have currency. If the TVET sector will be responsive than it will be crucial in TVET that the students produced there, also gain a sound foundation of flexible knowledge
and skills that can allow them to learn new things when necessary and adapt to different working conditions (Moll et. al, 2005).

2.5 WBE IN SOUTH AFRICAN TVET COLLEGES

BACKGROUND OF WBE IN SOUTH AFRICAN TVET COLLEGES

TVET colleges offer two core curricula which are general vocational and occupational qualifications. According to UNESCO (2014), the general vocational qualification, which was introduced in 2007, gave rise to NCV programme which comprises of three components: theory, practice and Workplace Based Experience (WBE). The aim of the general vocational curricular is to bridge the gap and assisting in linking skills training for youth with industry. The TVET colleges focus mainly on WBE (SSACI, 2012).

For the purpose of this study it is imperative to give background information on WBE. WBE started as a development supported by SSACI in partnership with the Department of Higher Education and Training. In 2008, a study was conducted in the four TVET colleges to develop a WBE model. Recent government policies-including the New Growth Path, National Development Plan, the National Skills Accord, the National Skills Development Strategy 111 (2011-2016) and the Green Paper for Post-School Education and Training highlight the expansion of access to TVET colleges as critical to achieving the national skills development and growth objectives (Marock, 2015).

In 2010 six TVET colleges were earmarked, where a document process and best practices were captured and gave rise to a first WBE manual. Furthermore, in 2011, WBE was included in DHET’s Reporting and Monitoring Framework. Its value was further recognised in National Policy, the National Skills Development Strategy 3 (NSDS III) and the National Skills Accord. In 2012, about 48 TVET colleges management teams were trained, and a revised WBE manual came into place (SSACI, 2012). In 2013, a White Paper on building an expanded, effective and integrated post-school system came into place. This document provides information on the purpose of the TVET colleges (SACCI, 2012).

As post-school education in South Africa requires education and training to include work-integrated learning or work based education, TVET colleges are earmarked as the best institutions in providing a proper platform. Work integrated learning (WIL) is not a new
concept as it emerged in 1900s, aimed at bridging the gap between theory and practical. WIL refers to a short period of learning and experience in a real world of work. It is an umbrella term for exposure and or practical experience for on-course students in the place of work not in a simulation centre (Malale & Sentsho 2014). Furthermore, these activities include simulation of practical work. “WIL practice does not in any way replace the use of simulation centres. Herman Schneider launched Work Integrated Learning (WIL) in 1906 at the University of Cincinnati, in the United States of America with the above aim in mind” (Sovrilla & Varty 2011: 3). He became convinced that in order for the students to understand and master the concepts and skills in class theoretically, the practical experience is required. In that idea, he asserts what Dewey (1938) believed, that any given experience is the result of an interaction between that which students carry to a given situation and what actually happens there.

This concept is further supported by an idea that students learn through their action rather than through the actions of their lecturers hence workplace based education (Welsh, 2007: 79).

WBE is seen by Chisholm, Harris, Worthwood & Johrendt (2009: 326) as a multi-disciplinary approach based on four components, namely the foundation of experiences, reflection, abstract conceptualisation and application.

On the 29th of April 2010, Dr Blade Nzimande, the Minister of Higher Education and Training launched the first draft of the Framework for the National Skills Development 2011/12-2015/16, where he states that the biggest contributions to poverty are unemployment and low-paid work (DHET, 2010). He further states that the current governments’ position in the new development and growth for South Africans is in the productive activities. So, for South Africa to obtain faster economic growth, greater employment rates, and to reduce poverty, skills development will play a vital role (DHET, 2010: 6). This implies that quality education coupled with training is a necessity in all levels if the dream of skills development was to be realised.

2.6 INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVES OF WBE

2.6.1 KENYA

It has been stated in Nyerere (2009:3) that “In the year 2000, government leaders of 189 countries agreed to reduce poverty, and to accomplish the eight concrete development goals
known as ‘The Millennium Development Goals’ (MDGs). In 2007, the Netherlands Government decided to boost achieving the MDGs through a common effort of all ministries. This plotting exercise therefore aims to chart out the existing stakeholders and their interests in TVET, past experiences and good practices regarding demand and supply of the TVET and identify the strong and weak elements of the TVET sector”.

Above all, “the Kenya’s general election predicament of December 2007 reflected the problem of a large population of unskilled, unemployed youth amidst growing poverty” (Nyerere, 2009:3). In order to address some of the fundamental causes of the edginess among youth, the government made initiatives that will promote skills development. This includes investment within the framework of the Kenya’s Education Sector Support Programme 2005-2010 (KESSP). KESSP states the aims and purpose of TVET in Kenya to include the involvement of stakeholders in the development of a national skills training strategy, establishments of mechanisms and appropriate incentives to promote private sector investments in the development of TVET.

The above involvement, by implication gives rise to the increased access to the TVET sector by Kenyan youth, provision of loans and bursaries to enhance access to TVET taking special account to marginalised groups, such as female students and the physically challenged and mobilization of resources to rehabilitate facilities in public TVET institutions to ensure quality training (Government of Kenya-GoK, 2008).

TVET programmes in Kenya target to absorb the large proportions of students who cannot progress to the secondary and higher levels of education, a view shared by Ministry of Education (2005). Approximately 600,000 graduates of primary education, only 55% (350,000) proceed to secondary school (GoK, 2007). At the end of the secondary cycle only “20,000 proceed to universities, the rest (200,000) are expected to be catered for by the middle level colleges and TVET institutions whose existing capacity is adequate. In 2007, the enrolment in the TVET institutions increased by 7.5%; from 71,16 in 2006 to 76,516 in 2007” (GoK, 2007).
Nyerere (2009) points out that in Kenya, there were serious mismatches between supply and demand for skilled labour and noted widespread underemployment in the informal sector and low productivity. This implies that technical and vocational education and training should therefore be demand driven.

In addition to that the TVET curriculum must also “be able to promote business philosophy so as to supply a wide range of employment opportunities to most youth and others seeking employment. However, one of the burning issues about current TVET curriculum is that it is weak and not flexible enough to meet the technological changes and diverse needs of different users. This has been the case with the South African TVET curriculum as” (Gewer, 2010).

Furthermore, “the quality of TVET graduates has declined in recent years due to poor instructional methods, out-dated or inadequate training equipment and lack of meaningful work experience and poor supervision during attachment. Above all, it has been found that teacher experience for the majority of teachers in Kenya had remained inadequate in TVET institution” (Kigwilu & Githinji, 2015).

In addition to that, it also creates challenges of the “quality of graduates from these institutions. The graduates of TVET institutions have experienced technology shock when they finally enter the job market” (Nyerere, 2009). In Gichira (2002), most of “the private training institutions are faced with almost the same problems as those encountered by the public institutions”.

As a result, “the quality of TVET private training institutions in the Entrepreneurial Education is affected further by: Over concentration on light: vocational skills, business, commercial and service courses because of the high investment associated with technology based courses, employment of part-time instructors who are paid less, burdened with large classes with less facilities, enrolments of students left out by the public institutions and the increase of unregistered institutions likely to offer low quality training” (Nyerere, 2009).

In spite of the challenges, the TVET programs are limited in scale due to challenges such as lack of co-ordination of training leading to unbalanced duplication in the production of skilled personnel across the entire sector. This gives rise to the mismanagement of scarce resources, conflicts of jurisdiction and under-utilization of available training facilities, weak or absent
research and documentation in TVET, obsolete curriculum, imbalance between rural and urban areas, few training institutions exists in rural areas as compared to urban centres as well as lack of a clear legal framework governing the TVET sector (Nyerere, 2009). By implication all the above challenges encountered by the Kenyan TVET sector, are also faced by the South African TVET sector (SSACI, 2012).

According to UNESCO (2000:12), the following recommendations were made to solve above mentioned challenges:

1. Establishing more linkages between TVET and other sectors which are education and private sector
2. Better co-ordination between the formal and informal training systems
3. Higher private sector participation
4. Orienting TVET towards sustainable development
5. Promoting broad access to learning and training throughout life, and making TVET an instrument for social inclusiveness and cohesion (Atchoarena & Delluc, 2001)

2.6.2 AUSTRALIA

Research in Australia, the United Kingdom and United States illustrates that students who had undertaken a work-integrated learning experience or a skill-development component during their course of study were more likely than others to have reflected positively on their practise and have achieved employment within their chosen field of study (Harvey, Moon, Geall, & Bower, 1997). This highlights the importance of assisting students with some kind of work-based experience before they exit their studies.

In order for effective programme to take place, “it requires access to quality learning environments, preparation and support for supervisory staff and establishment of relevant risk management and minimisation processes” (Orrell, Cooper & Jones, 1999).

Britzman (2003) proposes that “effective work experience must involve meaningful work as a means to an end, not an end in itself, that is to say, the experience alone is not sufficient to produce transformed learning”. Learning on-the-job must be purposeful and deliberate, also be supported by induction of students and supervisors and the envisioned development of relevant
assessment to ascertain the maintenance of appropriate standards as well as enough duty of care as postulates (Washbourn, 1996). It is therefore, important to ensure that reflection and debriefing on the work by all parties is made a requirement in order to achieve these standards.

In addition to that, “for work-placement programmes to be effective and achieve the purpose it was set to achieve, it ought to involve partnerships among diverse groups which include among others: employers, students, lecturers, institutions managers as well as professional bodies” (Harvey, Moon, Geall, & Bower, 1997). There is a need for the recognition of these parties in order to achieve sustained success. In addition to that, it is evident that the attainment of explicit mutual benefit is of vital importance. If for whatever reason, the benefit fails for any party, the partnership ceases to be effective (Harvey et al., 1997).

Moody (1997) argues that the most effective placement programmes happen where the host organisation is actively involved from the very onset, in the planning and where the organisation is committed to student learning.

Harvey & Knight (1996) point out that since 1996; Flinders University has seized the opportunity for cultural change in its preparation of its graduates. The main aim of this institution is to ensure that all students in all year levels obtain some leadership development and relevant workplace exposure and skills.

Vuoskoski & Poikela (2015) concur with Harvey & Knight (1996) that “students’ work-placement particularly in the context of education and Health are commended as potential sources for making student learning and course curriculum to be more relevant.”.

Prior 1996, there was no induction to the role of work place coordinators and there was no provision of support materials. As a result coordinators operated in isolation without any uniform framework to follow, as there was none in place. The philosophy of the placement programmes and the relationships between university and host organisations characterised a value added approach in which students were regarded as mere workers or observers.

Flinders University’s concern for ascertaining graduate employability is integrated into the curriculum and has developed a university culture where the teachings of work-based learning complement and enhance each other, which marks the success story for this university.
Martin (1998) came up with four key areas which form strategies that underpin this cultural change. The “first area concentrated attention on the development of intra-institutional partnerships between administration, faculty and service units to formulate a co-operative university climate for managing work-placement programmes and to help institutional transformation. The second area has a lot to do with the optimisation of students’ opportunities to acquire and develop work-related skills that complement and build on learning experiences. The third area includes a focus on staff development through a cross institutional forum. The fourth area concentrates on the development of university/industry collaborations with work-placement providers to begin to achieve a learning-focused, stakeholder approach to forming partnerships with host organisations.”

The above strategies imply that a lot can be learnt from the strategies employed by the Flinders University as a best practice to assist the South African TVET colleges in implementing Workplace Based Education.

2.7 NCV CURRICULUM STRUCTURE AND WBE COMPLIANCE

The TVET sector in South Africa can only be understood by differentiating between general post-school curriculum which takes place in a TVET college or training institution which aimed at young school leavers, and occupationally directed curriculum which takes place in the workplace and mostly directed more at adult learners (UNESCO, 2000). This study focuses mainly on general vocational curriculum done via the National Certificate (Vocational) programmes which give students some basic knowledge from which they can develop more specialised skills and knowledge. The problem is that TVET colleges do not offer links into workplace learning so that young people can apply their knowledge and skills (Moll et.al, 2005). These young learners are therefore unable to develop their knowledge and skills in a manner appropriate to the demands of the workplace; hence the third component of the vocational curriculum comes into play, which is WBE.

The vocational curriculum offers compulsory disciplinary knowledge in the form of three fundamentals (English, Mathematics/Mathematical Literacy, and Life Orientation). The vocational knowledge is taught via the four vocational subjects that include theoretical and practical knowledge. These four vocational subjects have three components which are theory, practice and WBE. In the NCV curriculum, WBE becomes a fully integrated part of the
institutional curriculum in the shape of well-planned, continuous experiential periods of WBE (SSACI, 2010).

In an ideal placement scenario, Level 2 students spend 5 days in workplaces, Level 3 students spend 10 days in workplaces and Level 4 students spend 15 days in workplaces. The placement of all students occurs mainly in the June-July holiday period. Compliance with these experiential periods requires effort from all parties involved in WBE in TVET sites. In this case, the onus rests entirely with the college management to ensure that compliance is observed and experiential periods are adhered to in order to benefit students. However, if well managed, WBE will yield numerous benefits for college students and employers as alluded upon above (Moll, et al., 2005).

2.8 THE ROLE OF TVET COLLEGES MANAGEMENT IN WBE IMPLEMENTATION

In order for WBE to yield the results it was originally set out for, it ought to be managed effectively. The college management needs to buy into the programme fully, to ensure successful implementation and the funding that will be needed, as well as to maintain partnerships with industries and host employers. Effective management of WBE includes development of a clear strategy at a College level and be reinforced by the Campus management at the campus level (SSACI, 2012).

Campus management is inclusive of the Campus Managers, Head of Units and Senior Lecturers. Decisions will have to be taken by the college management regarding learners, whether all learners will be involved or not. If not, what will be the selection criteria? Also issues like how will WBE be included in the college timetable and lastly how will the college ensure that the experience is appropriate, adequately supervised and will deliver the required outcomes? (SSACI, 2012)

WBE implementation must be managed and monitored in line with the action plans developed at College level. Management of WBE programme, report on information as well as review and evaluation are key factors in the management and practical application of WBE (SACCI, 2012). In SSACI (2010) initiative proposes twenty two steps under the WBE cycle; the College
management must follow when implementing WBE. The cycle has four phases of implementation which are planning, preparation, placement and post-placement respectively.

SSACI (2012) states that the DHET Reporting and Monitoring Framework gives the direction to the performance measures of colleges, which are captured according to five themes: access, throughput, management, teaching and learning, and employability where WBE comes into place. This framework has three components in which input measures, process measures and output measures cover the above-mentioned themes. The above mentioned framework emphasises, firstly, input measures, which have a lot to do with access, management and employability. Access speaks to the recruitment and selection procedures, programme qualification mix (PQM), enrolment growth and financial support. Management deals with lecturer and management capacity, budget allocation for WBE, infrastructure and equipment development as well as employability which touches on the partnership and industry linkages.

Secondly, the framework emphasises process measures which has a lot to do with teaching and learning besides management and employability. Teaching and learning deals with the monitoring of assessment, assessment retention, attendance, classroom management as well as student support services (SSS). Management under this measure has a lot to do with finance, human resources and development, information and the management of resource usage. Employment touches on the effective access to workplaces during studies.

Lastly, the same framework also emphasises output measures which includes throughput and employability. Throughput has a lot to do with certification in the NCV programme, Report 191(N1-N6) as well as occupational programmes. Employability focuses on access to workplace learning through internships, apprenticeships and access to self-employment. It is apparent in this framework that employability is covered in all the three components, which is indicative of its importance which can be achieved through effective implementation of WBE at the college level (SSACI, 2012).

2.8.1 Proposed steps or guidelines in ensuring compliance

Phase 1: Planning phase

Step 1       Develop a WBE strategy and allocate a budget
Step 2  Develop action plans for WBE implementation

**Phase 2: Preparation phase**

Step 3  Inform students about available WBE opportunities

Step 4  Hold the first lecturer/staff briefing meeting (to provide information on plans for WBE and get their buy in in the preparation activities)

Step 5  Recruit employers to host students, including conducting exploratory logbooks

Step 6  Develop WBE learning frameworks and develop or obtain supporting logbooks

Step 7  Facilitate the student recruitment, application and selection process

Step 8  Hold the second lecturer/staff briefing meeting (to provide information on logbooks and plan their involvement in placement and post-placement activities)

Step 9  Conduct planning meetings with new and previous host employers

Step 10  Match students to host employers

Step 11  Facilitate student briefing meetings

Step 12  Facilitate student completion of WBE documentation as contained in the logbooks

Step 13  Finalise all WBE arrangements and logistics

**Phase 3: Placement phase**

Step 14  Students are placed with host employers and monitored by the college during their placement

**Phase 4: Post placement phase**

Step 15  Students complete their logbooks and hand these in for processing and assessment

Step 16  Process and assess student logbooks
Step 17 Facilitate student presentations on their WBE

Step 18 Hold student WBE reflection meetings (one meeting per programme or level for which WBE is provided)

Step 19 Hold reflection sessions with host employers on student WBE

Step 20 Hold college lecturer/staff reflection sessions on student WBE

Step 21 Hold a college management reflection session on student WBE (attended by the WBE coordinator, relevant members of college management and programme-level WBE management teams)

Step 22 Acknowledge employer support

2.9 BENEFITS OF WBE FOR STUDENTS, HOST EMPLOYERS AND TVET COLLEGES

In order for the WBE component to yield the desired results, it requires effective partnerships between all stakeholders, to provide valuable learning opportunities to advance the notion of work readiness. Effective WBE activities meet the needs of students, industries/host employers as well as the TVET colleges in developing, delivering and reflecting upon learning experiences that benefit all stakeholders (Watts, 2008). The cited benefits below are evident to the view shared by Watts.

2.9.1 Benefits for TVET Colleges students

WBE also yields numerous benefits for students, colleges and for employers (SSACI, 2012) which amongst others include development of motivation, maturity, confidence and interpersonal skills; increased retention of learning and improved academic performance; clarification of career options and more directed study towards final choices; development of an understanding of how work in their field of study is carried out to certain specifications of time, quality and cost, through prescribed processes and using particular technology; improved employability through the resultant record of work experience, the opportunity to be previewed by potential employers and the development of a network of professional contacts Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, OECD (2004).

These benefits marks the importance of WBE component and necessitates its’ implementation by the TVET colleges. Malale & Sentsho (2014) emphasise that TVET colleges must “ensure
that students get exposure to the world of work”. They identify the following as benefit of WBE to students:

### 2.9.1.1 Creation of networks: networking of interns

In SSACI (2012:8) the necessity for compliance in the implementation of WBE by TVET colleges is strengthened by the following comments from students who have received workplace-experience:

> “The work placement helped me to understand completely because everything they teach me, they also let me do it practically and that made me understand better by doing it”

> “I now have a clear understanding of the course I have chosen”

> “It gave me an idea of what employers are looking for and what they expect”

> “The experience was extremely useful-I learned not only what it is to work, but also what my life could be”

> “It has helped with my practical skills a lot because I worked daily on a particular machine. I also worked with experienced employees who helped with a few tips”

> “I learned that the company is not a playground. I could die if I did not follow the safety rules” (SSACI, 2012:8)

### 2.9.2 Benefits of WBE for host employers or industries

Benefits for host employers among others as (SSACI, 2012) records them include a source of skilled employees who better fit organisational needs; a better screening process for potential employees; reduced recruitment and induction costs; job enrichment and improved morale for permanent staff who are assigned to mentor trainees; development of a culture of learning within the organisation and an opportunity to influence college curricula and be influenced by it more especially in terms of new ideas, systems, processes and technology. These benefits emphasise the importance of partnership between the industry and the colleges, if the opportunity to influence college curricula by the industries is to be realised.

Gewer (2010) posits that the critique of the NCV curricula will be minimal if the industries or host employers are afforded an opportunity to contribute their ideas. Some comments from the
host-employers or companies in relation to the students hosted for WBE among others, paves a direction for future best practices according to (SSACI, 2010: 11)

“The student is brilliant, a hardworking and a smart worker. She is definitely going to make a great impact in the mechanical industry…”

“She has a right attitude. She thinks of the duties assigned to her…Shows continuous improvement in what she does”

“A very good student. He asked a lot and was willing to learn and wants to find out”

“Poor timekeeping” (SSACI, 2012:11)

2.9.3 Benefits for TVET Colleges

Lastly the benefits of WBE for TVET Colleges include among others the increased alignment of college programmes with the current industry practice and skills needs; continuous feedback from the employers on the performance of students and currency of college curricula; increased motivation for students, leading to higher pass and throughput rates; enhancement of the college’s reputation for providing high-quality rated training that leads to employment and additional human and material resources arising from closer linkages and partnerships with employers (SSACI, 2012).

In essence, drawing from above benefits, there is a mutual benefit accrued from this process as stakeholders understand their respective roles and responsibilities and consequently articulated expectations and shared understanding of WBE (DHET, 2013); (OECD, 2004).

2.10 KEY CONSIDERATIONS FOR ORGANISING WBE FOR STUDENTS

The college management need to consider that to have only workplace experiences is alone not sufficient for students’ learning, in order to make it sufficient it must be augmented by pedagogic practices (Watts, 2008). This implies the importance of striking a balance between three components which are: theory, practical as well as workplace based learning.

Another key factor to be considered by the college management is the students’ readiness to engage in their learning, readiness involves interests, realism and capacities. It is therefore the
responsibility of the college management to ensure that students are engaged in their learning. SSACI (2012). Another key factor to be considered by the college management is the importance of engagement with students which speaks to preparing them for WBE before they are engaged through briefing and information giving sessions, and through support which happens during the experience where sharing and proper guidance is given to students as well as in assisting them to connect with the two set of experiences which will take place after the WBE experience through focus groups and critical reflective sessions (SSACI, 2010).

Lastly an importance of aligning all participants (which are in this case, students, staff and industry partners or host employers) understanding of the purposes of WBE and its processes as well as integrating insights from practice into the broader curriculum using WBE as a platform are key factors to be considered by the college management as they organise WBE for students practices (Moreland, 2005).

2.11 THE NATIONAL SKILLS DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY 3

The National Skills Development Strategy 3 highlights the importance of workplace-based learning and experience, while seeks to encourage and support the integration of workplace teaching with theoretical learning (DHET, 2013:5). The NSDS III responds to the critical challenges that are impacting on the ability of the South African economy to grow and afford TVET graduates increased employment opportunities (DHET, 2013:6).

In the absence of a policy which encourages WBE (with an exception of a Sample policy drafted by SSACI (2012), NSDS III (DHET, 2013) is used as a strategy to be followed to point the direction towards achieving the goal of providing WBE for students as an integral part of the NCV curriculum. Taking into account the two goals among eight goals of the NSDS 3 which are to promote the growth of public FET system that is responsive to sector, local, regional and national skills needs and priorities and encourage sustainable use of workplace-based skills development (DHET, 2013). It is therefore, indisputably apparent that this national strategy addresses the “scarce skills and poor work readiness of many young people leaving formal secondary and tertiary education entering the labour market for the first time”.

What makes the above scenario worse is the insufficient linkages between institutional and workplace learning, which in turn can reduce the employability chances and provide work readiness of the successful graduates from TVET colleges and HET institutions as Gewer (2010) posits. Therefore, WBE which is structured to fit into the NCV curriculum will likely
to alleviate this challenge (CHE, 2011). The main aim of the NSDS 3 is to offer training to the post-school education and training system (DHET, 2013). In order to achieve that, the TVET colleges should start developing their programmes with strong partnerships between colleges and industry in mind.

It is believed that for the WBE programme to be successful, these partners must work in close collaboration to ensure progress. These partners are the student, the host employer and the TVET College (Liodakis, Manitis, Vardiambasis, Makris, Antonidakis & Tataraus, 2006). This implies that these partners must all cooperate on equal basis by acknowledging certain responsibilities. The expected guidance to the learners must be given on regular basis, be perpetual and thus, it is essential that both mentors and supervisors possess the necessary knowledge and experience required to be able to offer appropriate guidance.

Forbes (2003) postulates that “the role of these partners is to participate in developing and introducing effective education and training programmes and in adapting to technological advancements within a short experiential periods of time”. This automatically gives rise to the why, the wherewithal and the how parts of doing what are prescribed in the NSDS 3 (SACCI, 2012).

In addition to what is highlighted in the NSDS 3, subsections (c) and (d) of the Skills Development Act (No.97, 1998) further encourage the employees to use the workplace as an active learning environment.

This is likely to provide them with opportunities to acquire new skills, provide opportunities for new entrants to the labour market to gain work experience, and lastly ensure the quality of education and training in and for the workplace (DHET, 2013). This implies that the aforementioned opportunities can be offered by TVET colleges by strengthening the implementation of the NCV curriculum to provide workplace-based learning. WBE should be implemented effectively and be well coordinated, controlled and monitored.

The philosophy of cooperative education seeks to address the interface between work and learning, which is seen as problematic but doable. NCV curriculum structure should adhere to this philosophy. There should be compliance with the policy and regulations for providing WBE experience. The main focus of WBE is learning on the job and not working (Moll, et al., 2005; DHET, 2013).
2.12 CHALLENGES OF WBE IMPLEMENTATION FACED BY THE TVET COLLEGES MANAGEMENT

The “wherewithal” touches on the challenges involved in the implementation of a successful WBE programme. The main hurdle currently is that there are no formal DHET systems in place for experiential workplace training. If these were to be included, there should be clear guidelines on the: overall logistics, roles and responsibilities of all participants, full integration of workplace and institutional learning, assessment of learners, and procedures for dealing with legal liabilities (Gewer, 2010).

Another challenge is that many companies are also sceptical about the quality of NCV curriculum. Most of these companies’ managers’, view NCV curriculum as poorly aligned to the needs of industry. They seem to be largely out of touch with each other. Furthermore, there is a concern that the content of the NCV curriculum does not accurately align with skills requirements in the industries concerned (SACCI, 2012).

More fundamentally, there appears to be persistent absence of an enabling framework for colleges and industry to work together (Cannan, 2008). Another cited challenge is that “of TVET colleges’ lack of capabilities and credibility to engage with industry on equal terms”. On the other hand employers are reluctant to work with colleges and do not have faith in the college’s ability to produce quality graduates (Wessels, 2005; SSACI, 2012).

In addition to that, “there is a shortage of work experience places especially in rural areas, as formal big businesses are very few”. Another challenge is that of inaccessible employers due to distance as many students come from poor backgrounds and the stipends cannot cover both transport costs and meals. The latter touches on the budget constraints to fund WBE component. (Shircore, Kate, Nichola, & Daniel (2013).

2.12.1 Assessment of Workplace Based Education

The Council on Higher Education (2011) developed a blueprint for conducting assessment in WBE, like assessment of theory and practical, it must be based on the same principles
underpinning assessment which are, fairness, transparent, formative as well as summative, valid, authentic, and consistent.

The formal recommendation was made to assess WBE as a coherent assessment strategy. Assessing experience might require innovative forms of assessment to be used, such as logbooks, learning diaries, portfolios of evidence, student progress files together with the relevant marking criteria (CHE, 2011). When WBE assessment is planned, the following questions are mostly involved with regards to the information needed and the way in which it will be obtained (Dreyer, 2013) namely: why assess, what to assess, who will assess, how to assess, where to assess and when to assess?

Taylor (2013) findings in the Paper for National Skills Conference revealed that integrating WBE in the NCV curriculum offers a sustainable solution to what would otherwise be a temporary intervention, over and above incorporating it in the college calendar. WBE must be assessed in order for it to be taken seriously by colleges and it increases the quality of the qualification.

The TASK books are designed in collaboration with colleges and guides workplaces and students on activities that must be completed during WBE. Students must provide evidence of their work experience and a completed task book does this.

The ICASS task books are based on the generic task book format developed by SSACI (Taylor, 2013:7). The generic task books has been improved by adding a subject specific activity for each subject in a programme offering. The task books are structured around four parts as follows:

Part 1: Understanding WBE- which introduces the student to WBE and includes information on the programme.

Part 2: Preparation and WBE- forms which includes forms and documents that support the placement, like employer information and a student learning agreement.

Part 3: WBE placement assignments- which has the activities to be completed during the placement
Part 4: Confirmation and evaluation of WBE- includes a student and employer evaluation and an employer letter to confirm the student’s placement and lastly…

Part 5: Assessment-which includes the assessment rubric and mark table.

In addition to above five parts, there are five placement assignments specifically in Part 3 which are:

Assignment 1: Workplace Induction checklist
Assignment 2: General workplace activities
Assignment 3: Subject specific activities
Assignment 4: Daily activity log and journal and;
Assignment 5: WBE presentation

Below is the example of WBE activities in the business programme task books (Taylor, 2013)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assignment 2</th>
<th>Activity 1: Overview of the workplace (generic)</th>
<th>The first 3 activities are generic for all college programmes- Engineering and Business. These activities are designed to give students a general orientation to the workplace and career in the field of their study.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Activity 2: Health and Safety aspects (generic)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Activity 3: Appreciate your career path (generic)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assignment 3</td>
<td>Activity 4: Subject-specific activity (vocational subject 1)</td>
<td>Activities 4 to 7 are subject-specific. One activity per vocational and one for the optional subject is included.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Activity 5: Subject-specific activity (vocational subject 2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activity 6: Subject-specific activity (vocational subject 3)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activity 7: Subject-specific activity (optional subject)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Task book: Business studies Programme**

The subject-specific activities (activities 4-7) above, for the business studies programme are to ensure customer satisfaction, plan and prioritise tasks, team work, develop a project plan, develop a budget, complete an income statement and balance sheet, analyse and interpret an income statement and balance sheet, pricing and costing, prepare PowerPoint documents and an Excel spreadsheet, prepare a promotional presentation on the benefits of WBE and lastly investigate a product or service in relation to LED environment.

In order to ascertain validity of WBE for assessment purposes, each activity and page of the activity log and journal must be signed off by employers, students and lecturers as in the following example:

**Verification of student WBE (Taylor, 2013:10)**

**HOST EMPLOYER APPROVAL**

The supervisor hereby agrees that the information included is accurate and was obtained in an acceptable manner to the employer.

Supervisor’s name (Print) ____________________________________________

Supervisor (Signature) ________________ Date __________________________

Student (Signature) ________________ Date __________________________

**COLLEGE APPROVAL.**
The books are assessed using a rubric which constitutes of 5 sections, A-E. Each section assesses a different part: Section A assesses the generic parts and Section B-E each assess one subject. The table below gives an overview of the rubric for the programme Office Administration.

Example of an assessment rubric: Office Administration (Adapted from Taylor, 2013)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SECTION</th>
<th>ACTIVITY ASSESSED</th>
<th>SUBJECT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Section A</td>
<td>Induction Checklist, activities 1-3, and the Daily Log and Journal</td>
<td>All subjects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section B</td>
<td>Activity 4: Ensure customer satisfaction</td>
<td>Office Practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section C</td>
<td>Activity 5: Plan and prioritize tasks</td>
<td>Business Practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section D</td>
<td>Activity 6: Prepare PowerPoint and Excel documents</td>
<td>Office Data Processing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section e</td>
<td>Activity 7: Optional subject</td>
<td>Optional subject</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mark for a subject is made up of 2 marks: Section A, which counts for 50% and the section specific to the subject, which also amounts to 50%. A practical example is the mark for Office Data Processing is made up of the mark from Section A and Section D.

2.12.2 The challenge of assessing professional competence in WIL
The alignment theory suggests that assessment of WIL as with the assessment of WBE must include an evaluation of students’ capacity to show professional competence in the workplace (Biggs, 2003 & Tang, 2011). It is therefore, apparent that this kind of assessment poses a challenge. The challenge came about because of the large number of students to be assessed in external placements, which poses a serious challenge for the supervisor concerned. That will deem the assessment unreliable. If evidence of professional competence is only furnished by the student, that will also consider the assessment invalid as suggested by (Delahaye & Choy, 2007; Dochy, Mien, Gifbels, & Struyven, 1997).

Workplace learning has been seen in many institutions as a means of developing students’ traits and employability skills (Bates, Bates, & Bates, 2007). This strategy has gained momentum in Australian universities.

Due to the ever growing demand for graduates to gain some kind of experience and be ‘work-ready’ many Australian universities have recently increased the importance on WIL. (Patrick, Peach, Pocknee, Webb, Fletcher & Pretto, 2008:3). The 2008 Australian Learning and Teaching Council commissioned National Scoping study into WIL, which identifies fundamental challenges encountered by universities in implementing WIL. This further include the need to develop innovative assessment methods that promote reflection and integration of theory and practice within the constraints that results from the level of engagement of workplace supervisors and the ability of academic supervisors to become involved in the workplace. Some kind of partnership between these supervisors is of vital importance (Patrick, Peach, Pocknee, Webb, Fletcher, & Pretto, (2008).

Professional competence is defined by Kane (1992) as “the ability to use professional knowledge and skills in the workplace”. In the alignment theory Biggs (2003) suggests that “the assessment of students in WIL should also include their assimilated demonstration of professional competence in the workplace”. Assessment of students’ professional competence in WIL poses serious problems for both academic supervisors and students, in terms of reliability and validity of assessment. WIL as Delahaye & Choy (2007:3) and (Dochy et al, 1997) put it, brings a ‘dual emphasis on the development of both the learner and the organisation or contextualising the content within the learning environment in the workplace.
In addition, the theory of constructive alignment suggests that learning objectives, teaching methods and assessment should be constructively aligned (Biggs, 2003; Ryan, 2011). What is significant about this theory is that it is student centred, and it affords a student an opportunity to do the real work in the real working environment. In this instance, the lecturer or the supervisor concerned should act as a mere advisor between the student and a learning environment that supports the appropriate learning activities (Biggs, 2003:27). This theory encourages integration of learning, instruction and assessment that results in ‘assessment as a tool for learning, instead of a tool of learning (Dochy et al, 1997).

The alignment theory advocates that, “the first step in designing a learning experience is to express the learning objectives by using verbs that reflect the anticipated cognitive level an idea shared by (Jones, 2010)”.

The next step is to design teaching or learning activities that are most likely to inspire students to achieve the objectives. Lastly is to select assessment tasks that will determine whether the objectives set are achieved and how each student can meet the criteria stated in the objectives.

In Jones (2010) the first step in designing a learning experience is to develop the learning outcomes. A careful examination of literature suggests that the learning outcomes of WIL should include the following aspects which are: learning theory, critical reflection, professional competence and career management. As Brodie & Irving (2007) put it, WIL involves three fundamental components which are learning theory which relates to understanding how to learn, critical reflection and as well as capability. Capability has a lot to do with transferrable skills and know-how. Walo (2001:12) asserts that “WIL provides opportunities for students to practice what they learnt in the classroom, gain a greater understanding of the industries requirements, test career choices and develop important hands-on workplace skills.”

The WIL learning activities relevant to the development of professional competence include the work placement and feedback from the workplace supervisor. Stuckey (2007) recommends the principle of providing timeous feedback to TVET students as a key principle that should be met by workplace based programmes. In this instance, feedback according to (Walo, 2001; SSACI, 2010) can stimulate a profound connection with the learning process for the students and is critical in facilitating effective learning experience in the workplace contexts.
This by implication says, students need to be supported in terms of preparation for their placement, identification of skills or competencies to be developed during the placement. Students need to also prepare to assess their own progress and learn from their acquired experience. In addition, students need to get clear guidance from lectures as to what the learning expectations from placement are and how to achieve them and the difference between work and what is learnt at work (Walsh, 2007). Alignment theory further suggests that “only those assessment tasks that speak to whether and how well each student can meet the criteria stated in the objectives should be selected” (Biggs, 2003:30).

The assessment of professional competence is also important in order to provide feedback to students on their performance in the workplace. Stuckey (2007) argues that recording student performance, providing apt feedback and training students to receive honest feedback are key principles that should be incorporated in WIL programmes.

It is strongly recommended that professional competence be included in the summative assessment of WIL in order to ascertain that alignment of learning objectives and assessment and to provide feedback to students on their performance. WIL generally uses a range of assessment tools such as reflective journals and student presentations, to assess learning theory, critical reflection and career management (Patrick et al, 2008; Shircore et al, 2013).

In addition to that, it may be argued that there are fundamental difficulties in assessing professional competence. One of those difficulties is that it is not clear how professional competence can be assessed even though it may be possible to assess a list of specific discipline knowledge and skills that students would be expected to achieve in any placement, it may however be argued that such assessment may not always be satisfactory (Ram, 2008:137 and Hodges & Ayling (2007:50).

“…reducing the full range of skills and competencies utilized in a professional practice to pre-specified, observable work actions or behaviours… [Is] educationally unsound”.

This goes even if the possibility exists of classifying skills to be assessed. A solution to the above challenge according to Kane (1992:7), in order to avoid reducing the full range of skills to observable work actions assessors ought to ensure that what is being assessed as professional competence is the:
the degree to which the individual can use the knowledge, skills, and judgement associated with the profession to perform effectively in the domain of possible encounters defining the scope of professional practice’’

Another challenge is that the assessment of professional competence is considered erratic when evidence of understanding to learn, critical reflection and career management can be based exclusively on the evidence supplied by the student.

If evidence furnished by the student is solely relied upon, then what is assessed is not professional competence, but it is rather the student’s ability to articulate their own competence (Brodie & Young, 2007). A possible solution in this regard will be to ensure that the assessment of professional competence focuses beyond the evidence provided by students. In this case, the workplace supervisor is an alternative source of evidence.

Relying on assessment by workplace supervisor raises issues such as quality assurance and the reliability of the assessment (Brodie & Irving, 2007; Dreyer, 2013).

Furthermore, the supervisor’s assessment may not be necessarily reliable because it is immensely dependent on the professional ability of that supervisor concerned (Delahaye, 2005). Resistance from workplace supervisors to be directly involved in the assessment of students is another serious cause for concern (Stone & McLaren, 1999:176).

Experience has shown that, when agency employees are asked to grade an intern, they almost unanimously recommend an A. Among the possible reasons for this recommendation is that agency members may view the grade as a reward for the student interns, who are often unpaid; or the A may simply be a method to encourage more students to intern in their company.

In trying to provide a solution to the above challenge, (Costley & Armsby, 2007) argue that as much as it is still useful to include the workplace supervisor in the assessment of WBE, in spite of the challenges, necessary steps should be taken to address the concerns in relation to credibility and quality control. The institution may provide some guidance as to what is expected where workplace supervisors are involved in the assessment of students. Another solution will be “the use of standard criteria to be applied by supervisors in assessing student capability may improve reliability and quality control” (Delahaye, 2005).
Another solution is to increase the alternative pragmatic information available to academic supervisor which forms the students’ grade (Stone & McLaren, 1999; Dreyer, 2013). The main issues with regard to the reliability could be avoided if the assessment of professional competence were to be made by the academic supervisor through direct observation, simulation or objective tasks.

Conversely, in order to ensure reliability, the performance would need to be observed “over the full range of encounters in the domain of professional encounters” (Kane, 1992:8).

2.13 CONCLUSION

The literature reviewed in this chapter provides the theoretical framework and background of the compliance of the TVET colleges’ NCV curriculum implementation with the National policy. The NCV curriculum structure and background of WBE was critically analysed to assess the level of compliance with regard to WBE implementation as one of the three components.

National and international policies regarding WBE implementation were widely reviewed and steps in the implementation process were discussed in length by exploring the works of different theorists. It appears that there are systematic challenges facing college management in ensuring effective implementation which were highlighted in this review. Assessment of WBE as a component was also reviewed. A fundamentally point to make is that TVET is no longer just about training in skills acquisition for specific occupations. TVET curriculum has a lot to do with training which is geared towards the development that may provide a route to employment in the workplace. Over and above that, if implemented effectively, it may also provide a basis for further development of knowledge at a higher level, so that the individual can cope with changing technologies in the workplace.

A point to be made after the review of literature is that for compliance to be achieved in the NCV curriculum structure is to ensure that the government plays a strategic role as an enabler and facilitator of TVET curriculum rather than as a service provider especially by ensuring that WBE is financed and considered the most important component of the NCV curriculum structure. The promotion of mutually beneficial partnerships with business (host employers),
TVET colleges and DHET and a creation of a skill-based certification also becomes the unavoidable task of the government in order to ensure compliance.

The next chapter presents a detailed discussion of the research methods and the entire design to be utilised for this study.

CHAPTER 3
RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter seeks to unpack the methodology used in this study to guide data collection procedure used when collecting data for this study. The main aim of this study was to determine whether the TVET colleges’ NCV curriculum structure complies with the national strategy and policy stipulations in offering WBE for students. (1) to establish the role of the college management in ensuring compliance with the vocational curriculum structure in offering WBE for students; (2) to check the level of awareness of the college management of the National Strategy policy (NSDS 3) and SSACI initiative which is in place for implementation of WBE in TVET colleges; and (3) to find out the challenges the TVET colleges’ management encounters when they have to implement the third component of the NCV curriculum structure.

A brief profile of the respondents gave better understanding and analysis of the interpretation and analysis of the findings. For research questions one and two, the process of analysing data commenced immediately after all questionnaires were collected from the participants. For the third question it took a little longer as the recorded interviews were to be transcribed to capture the responses verbatim, the responses for the data collected using the questionnaire as an instrument was coded and analysed manually, and was summarized and presented using the graphs.
The same chapter focused on how the research has been designed, the methodology used, research instruments as well as data analysis employed in trying to address the afore-mentioned problems.

3.2 RESEARCH DESIGN

This study uses a mixed methods design which collects both quantitative and qualitative data, because the researcher believes the combination of approaches results in a more complete understanding of educational problems (Sharma, 1999).

For the purpose of this study, both types of data are considered important, and they were collected simultaneously. De Vos, Strydom, Fouche’, & Delport. (2011: 435-436) “Are of view that the mixed vital principle is that the use of both quantitative and qualitative approaches in combination of research problems than mere using just one approach”. They further outline the following values of mixed methods approach, to mention but a few:

- Mixed methods research provides strengths that offset the weaknesses of both quantitative and qualitative research, and therefore has the potential to provide stronger inferences.
- Mixed methods research provides the opportunity for a greater assortment of divergent views and perspectives and makes researchers alert to the possibility that issues are more multifaceted than they may have initially supposed.
- Mixed methods research is said to be practical in the sense that researchers are free to use all methods possible to address a research problem as well as the fact that they combine inductive and deductive reasoning processes.
- According to Cohen, Manion & Morrison (2001), “a research design is used to describe the process for conducting a study, and its purpose, which is to help find appropriate answers to the research questions”. MacMillan and Schumacher (1993) “view research design as the plan and structure of investigation used to obtain evidence to answer research questions”.

Therefore, this study employed both quantitative and qualitative data collection methods in line with the above views. This study uses the questionnaire and an interview as data collection
instruments. The questionnaire has two sections. Section A is for biographical information of respondents, Section B with closed ended questions responding to the main research questions. For open ended questions of the questionnaire, interviews are used to solicit information from the respondents.

3.2.1 Data collection instruments

3.2.1.1 Quantitative Data Collection

Quantitative data was collected for the purpose of this study, to investigate the role of the college management in ensuring compliance with the vocational curriculum structure as well as to explore the level of awareness of the policies for WBE implementation.

Sharma (1990) explains quantitative data “as a positivist approach to test hypotheses and emphasize the measurement and analysis of causal relationships between variables”. The result of quantitative research is the collection of numbers that can be used to analyse the produced results (Cohen, Manion, & Morrison, 2007). It is relevant to this research since findings are presented in numerical format and questions require a choice between definite answers. A questionnaire with closed-ended questions (using a 5-point Likert scale) was used based on the college/campus management awareness of the National strategy and SSACI project initiative for implementing WBE in TVET colleges as well as the role of the college/campus management in ensuring compliance with the vocational curriculum structure for WBE implementation, was developed.

3.2.1.2 Qualitative Data Collection

Qualitative data was employed to solicit information from the respondents in the sample. It was used since it is concerned with the why and not the how part of its topic through the analysis of unstructured information, which in the context of this study. This data was chosen because it does not only rely on statistics or numbers as is the case with the quantitative data. The main purpose of the researcher was to dig deep in getting understanding through looking closely at people’s words and actions whilst responding. In accordance with Cohen, et al. (2007), open-ended questions of the interview were used for qualitative investigation, because
they provide rich and personal data, possible answers are unknown, and it is exploratory and appropriate to solicit participants’ views.

Sharma (2011) asserts that qualitative data usually involves direct interaction with individuals on a one-to-one basis, or in a group setting. Open-ended interview questions were used to collect data on the challenges the TVET colleges’ management encounter in practically implementing the third component of the NCV curriculum structure.

3.3 SAMPLING PROCEDURE

This study employed purposive sampling because to enable the researcher to make specific choice about which people to include in the sample. Cohen, et al. (2001) believes that “it is a sampling technique where participants are chosen because of some defining characteristics that make them the holders of the data needed for the study”. Campus managers, senior lecturers and WBE champions are believed to possess the richest possible source of information to answer the research questions than any other person, and they are relatively easy to reach. In this study two Campus Managers out of four NCV Campus Managers, six vocational Senior Lecturers and thirteen WBE champions formed part of this research, which constitute 50% representation of the entire TVET College in the Northern Zululand region. Sampling refers to “the process the researcher used to select a portion of the population for study” (Patton, 1990). Cohen, et al. (2001) state that the main concern in sampling is representativeness of the population about which the researcher wants to draw conclusions. According to Sharma (1999:91), the sample has to be representative of the entire population.

3.4 DATA COLLECTION PROCEDURES

3.4.1 Ethical Considerations

Jansen & Vithal (2004) posit that ethics as a set of moral principles which is suggested by an individual or a group and is subsequently widely accepted, and which offers rules and behavioural expectations about the most correct conduct towards experimental subjects and respondents, employers, sponsors, other researchers, assistants and students.
The University of Zululand Research Ethics Policy defines research ethics as the principles and practices that guide the ethical conduct of research. These should embody respect for the rights of others who are directly or indirectly affected by the research. Such rights include rights of privacy and confidentiality, protection from harm, giving informed consent, access to information pre- and post-research, and due acknowledgement. Ethical conduct in research also includes the avoidance of inflicting animal suffering of any kind, and protection of the environment.

The researcher had engaged with the University of Zululand policy and procedures on research ethics, and its policy and procedures on managing acts of plagiarism, and understood the grounds of their consent. The supervisors and the researcher had considered and discussed the ethical issues that arose from this research. The researcher therefore declared to the best of her knowledge that:

- The research did not fall into any category that requires special ethical obligation. Only individuals directly involved in WBE in a TVET college were used as participants in this study. The letter seeking permission to conduct research was forwarded to the TVET college principal.
- The research did not create any conflict of interest, real or perceived.
- The researcher was not involved in or associated with any project or activity that will become the subject-matter of the research, nor of the researcher’s family members, close friends or associates involved in any way.
- The researcher undertook to abide by the general principles set out in the University of Zululand policies, and by the obligations which the policies imposed, and to mitigate any ethical and other risks that might occur. In particular, the researcher undertook to:
  - Respect the dignity as well as anonymity and confidentiality of the participants.
  - Ensure that the research is relevant to the TVET sector in carrying out its’ mandate of addressing the skills shortages, and in addressing the dire lack of work experience, which is a national phenomenon.
  - Conduct the research and produce her dissertation on her own, subject to normal supervisory and collegial assistance. Acknowledge and attribute to others the ideas, designs, and writings that are not original.
3.5 DATA MANAGEMENT AND ANALYSIS

Miles and Huberman (1994:10-11) define data analysis as “consisting of three flows of activity that take place at the same time: data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing and verification”.

As the above three streams of activity are interwoven, for the purpose of this study these activities were engaged in throughout in a more cyclical way. In analysing the data, the aim of the study was borne in mind, which is to determine whether TVET colleges’ NCV curriculum structure complies with the national strategy (NSDS 3, 2013) and SSACI initiative in offering workplace-based experience for students.

The responses to the closed-ended questions were numerically presented in a frequency distribution table and analysed. The Likert-scale statements with both positive and negative responses was used, in which respondents were asked to rate their responses. The responses to the open-ended questions of the qualitative investigation were captured verbatim on a matrix. Responses were then analysed to identify commonalities and trends with regard to the challenges the campus management encounter when they have to send students for WBE. Completed questionnaires were analysed. Graphs were used to present data collected.

3.6 VALIDITY AND RELIABILITY

Validity is considered as “the fundamental aspect very effective to action research. Validity is defined as the degree to which the researcher has measured what he/she set out to measure” (Smith, 1991: 106). The validity of the instrument was ascertained through the opinions and advices of selected authorities in the field. On the other hand (Cohen et al, 2011) define reliability as “a measure of consistency over time and over similar samples, it yields similar
data from similar respondents over time. The reliability of the data provided was guaranteed by being consistent in using the same instruments in all the target population of the study”.

3.7 PILOT

A pilot study was used to test the validity of the instrument by giving it to a small group of participants from the intended population (Sharma, 1990: 173). It enabled the researcher to modify the instrument before sending it to the actual respondents.

The questionnaire of this study was piloted by targeting one TVET college NVC one campus manager, two senior lecturers and four WBE champions. The above respondents assisted a great deal in refining and modifying the research instrument in the following aspect; Refining the instrument by eliminating ambiguity in the questions, a lot of questions were to be re-phrased, and in modifying the instrument, there was a need for a structured one-on-one interview to be utilized for open-ended question which was initially to be a questionnaire.

A major reason of modifying an instrument was the respondents felt there is a lot they wished to say, which cannot be covered in the few lines provided for them to respond. The interviews would consume a lot of time but it was ideal that the researcher went for them in order to solicit views of the respondents effectively and capture every detail.

3.8 CONCLUSION

This chapter has stressed that research procedures are of vital importance in collecting data in order to address and answer the research questions. It outlined the research methods and instruments that were used in collecting data for this study. It has revealed that the research process is commonly informed by qualitative and quantitative or both (mixed methodology) methods. The chapter has explicitly defined the study population and the actual instruments that were used to collect data.

The next chapter deals with actual data analysis, presentation of such data and discussion of the results as well as implications thereof.
CHAPTER 4

DATA ANALYSIS AND PRESENTATION OF RESULTS

4.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter presents the findings and also gives an in-depth analysis of the results of the research questions presented in Chapter 1, which are: (1) to establish the role of the college management in ensuring compliance with the vocational curriculum structure in offering Workplace Based Education (WBE) for students; (2) to check the level of awareness of the college management of the National Strategy policy, the National Skills Development Strategy 3 (NSDS 3) and Swiss-South African Cooperatives Initiatives (SSACI) an initiative which is in place for implementation of WBE in TVET colleges; and (3) to find out the challenges the TVET colleges’ managements encounter when they have to implement the third component of the NCV curriculum structure. A brief profile of the respondents will pave the way for the findings. This case study utilised a population of twenty one respondents which are divided as follows: Two campus managers, six senior lecturers and thirteen WBE champions.

4.2 LECTURERS’ PROFILE

4.2.1 Qualifications

The profile information relating to lecturers who participated in this project is portrayed below under different subheadings. The analysis of data presented graphically presents the participants’ responses to the questionnaire which asked about their academic and professional qualifications. In the SSACI (2010) project, it is revealed that for the lecturer to effectively
facilitate WBE, a certain amount of industrial experience is a necessity for the facilitator, as is the relevant qualification.

### 4.2.1 Lecturers’ qualifications (n=21)

The analysis of data presented in Figure 4.2.1 shows the total numbers and percentages of participants’ qualifications.

![Figure 4.2.1 Lecturers’ qualifications](image)

Figure 4.2.1 above indicates that none of the respondents have matric/N3 only certificates, 5% have a matric-plus certificates, 19% have national diplomas, 48% have degrees, and 28% have postgraduate degrees.

According to Figure 4.2.1, 76% (48% plus 26%) of the participants are in possession of degrees. In the SSACI (2010), for lecturers to participate in the implementation of WBE they must have expertise coupled with experience in industry, so 76% of the respondents are adequately trained, as far as theoretical knowledge is concerned, to drive the WBE component forward – an indication that there is a future for WBE in the TVET sector. However, only 19%
of the respondents have an academic qualification coupled with experience in industry. This is a concern in view of the importance of such experience for driving WBE forward.

4.2.2 Lecturing/teaching experience (n=21)

The analysis of data in Figure 4.2.2 indicates the numbers and percentages of participants’ responses on their experience in lecturing/teaching.

According to Figure 4.2.2 none of the respondents had 0-2 years of lecturing experience, 24% had 3-4 years, and 38% 5-10 years and more. Carr (1995) attests to the necessity for experience in order to effectively implement WBE, in that educators show their understanding of the theory they learnt when they give a description of their knowledge, teaching strategies, attitudes to discipline, and the way they select curriculum content.

4.2.3 NC (V) levels lectured by respondents

Figure 4.2.3 below shows the numbers and percentages of actual levels the participants are lecturing, with the exception of two campus managers who do not teach, but do manage WBE as a curriculum (see Table 4.2.4 below).
The data presented in Figure 4.2.3 show participants’ responses regarding the actual levels they were lecturing at. Ideally, WBE is to be implemented from Level 2 to Level 4, not focused only on Level 4. If the latter is done, the implication will be that other levels are not necessarily important. Students at Level 2 and Level 3 must be exposed to a certain degree of industrial experience in order to direct their focus towards obtaining a qualification.

According to Figure 4.2.3, 26% of the respondents are lecturing at Level 2, and 37% at both Level 3 and Level 4. It is interesting to see that an equal percentage of respondents are taking Levels 3 and 4, with 26% at Level 2. This implies that the focus has not only shifted to Level 4, but other levels which are levels 2 and 3 of the NCV programme are also on board.
4.2.4 The role of respondents in WBE implementation

The analysis of data presented in Figure 4.2.4 shows participants’ responses regarding their role in WBE implementation.

![Figure 4.2.4 Participants’ role in WBE implementation (n=21)](image)

Figure 4.2.4 shows that 62% of the respondents are WBE champions, 10% (the lowest percentage) are campus managers, and 28% are senior lecturers. It is interesting that the highest percentage of respondents is WBE champions as they are mostly hands-on in the implementation process of WBE.

4.2.5 Location of the campuses

The data presented in Figure 4.2.5 show the campuses according to their geographical location. Their location has an impact in accessing host employers for easy WBE placements, and in determining the availability of industries in that location.
Figure 4.2.5 Location of campuses

Figure 4.2.5 above shows that 67% of the campuses are located in a semi-urban area, which implies that students must have some transport money for them to reach the host employers. That is when the issue of stipends comes into play. 33% of the campuses are urban, which means that students there have the advantage of easy access to host employers, and WBE champions are motivated to send students to those employers for experiential learning periods.

4.3 DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS IN LINE WITH THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS

4.3.1 The role of the college management in the effective implementation of WBE
Findings revealed that about 90% of respondents agreed that WBE has been implemented, but what was mostly common amongst all respondents with positive responses was the fact that although WBE is implemented in their respective campuses, the focus is on one specific level, which is Level 4 of the NCV programme.

The following themes were generated from the responses of the participants:

1. Campus management support of WBE implementation in their sites.
2. The role of WBE champions in the implementation process.
3. WBE assessment as part of the management role.
4. Communication between relevant stakeholders to ensure compliance.
5. Communication between campus management and work placement officers centrally.
6. WBE budget as an integral part in the implementation process.
7. Integration of WBE in the NCV curriculum to ensure compliance.

Respondents are identified as follows throughout this analysis:

Campus manager: CM plus a number, for example CM 1

Senior Lecturer: SL plus a number, for example SL 2

WBE Champions: WBE Champ plus a number, for example WBE Champ 3

4.3.2 Campus management support levels of WBE implementation in their sites

The data presented in Figure 4.3.2 shows the responses from the questionnaires distributed (in which they were asked to rate their responses in a 5 Likert scale regarding the support of WBE implementation by campus managers

*Figure 4.3.2 Campus management support of WBE*
According to Figure 4.3.2 the responses from questionnaires on the support of WBE implementation by campus managers revealed that 76% of the participants who responded were positive, and only 24% of the responses were negative. The high percentage of positive responses indicates that campus managers are supporting WBE implementation at their respective sites. This supports the DHET (2010), which speaks of the college/campus management having to buy into the WBE programme fully to ensure successful implementation, which includes maintaining partnerships with industries and host employers.

4.3.2.1 Availability of clear vision for WBE implementation

In order for effective implementation to take place, there must be a clear vision. Findings indicate that 57% of the responses were positive, but 43% attested to the unavailability of a clear vision for WBE implementation on campuses. No clear DHET guidelines were in place.

Furthermore, for implementation to be achieved, visits to the host employer must be made possible for assigned personnel to monitor the attendance and progress of the students placed. 81% of the respondents agreed that visits are made to the host employers. Only 19% were negative. Monitoring is vital for any project to yield the desired outcomes.

Buehring (2007) attests to the idea of monitoring as a fundamental aspect of any successful project implementation. Monitoring works well with support. So, support in this case speaks to the regular checking the progress of students placed in different sites. Visibility of the college staff in the respective workplace is an indication of support of the programme as against placing students and leaving them unattended. Support also entails assisting students with challenges they might face during the placement period. For that reason, it is apparent that sending students
out for experiential learning without monitoring them can result in the desired outcome not being attained, and the vision for WBE implementation not realised.

4.3.2.2 Enforcement of the WBE strategy of the college

Findings also revealed that the colleges’ WBE strategy is enforced by the campus managers. 52% of the respondents agreed and 48% disagreed on this item, so there is not much difference in the numbers of respondents. These figures reveal that not much enforcement is done by campus managers. It mainly remains the duty of the WBE champions to enforce it.

4.3.2.3 Developed action plans to guide the implementation of WBE

On this item, 71% of the respondents agreed to having developed action plans to give guidance on WBE implementation, and only 29% disagreed. This was a good sign, since without workable plans of action; it would be extremely difficult to implement WBE. Two campus managers interviewed were adamant that the campus had done enough:

CM 1: “Yes, it has done enough as some students have managed to secure employment, and some are permanently employed. However, students are not properly inducted at the workplace whilst still in college.”

CM 2: “They managed to place students in different programmes, and some are permanently employed.”

Nevertheless, responses from the implementers on the ground were contrary to the responses the campus managers gave, according to the responses below of one WBE champion and one senior lecturer. One WBE champion believed that the campus was not doing enough:

WBE Champ 1: “Unfortunately, not enough is done. The campus is not doing anything to make the programme known to host-employers.”

One senior lecturer believed that it has not been optimally implemented:

SL 1: “Certain programmes are running well with it, but for other programmes on the campus there is still a lot to be done in terms of optimisation.”
Another very interesting view was shared by a WBE champion when she revealed the uncertainty about the relevance of the workplace experience students are subjected to. It is indeed interesting to learn that a student can be placed as part of the NCV curriculum and compliance, but placed in an irrelevant work environment. Implementers will speak of compliance as students will be sent to workplaces, but relevance is vital for students to be employable.

WBE Champ 2: “Some students are placed in an irrelevant work environment, as where a student in a Hospitality programme is placed in Spar supermarket instead of a restaurant.”

Part of the reason why Level 4 is prioritised is because it is an exit level for NCV. One can deduce that campuses are somehow forced to implement this component, so that at least students exit the sector with a certain degree of workplace exposure. In an ideal placement scenario, Level 2 students spend 5 days in workplaces, Level 3 students spend 10 days in workplaces and Level 4 students spend 15 days in workplaces. The placement of all students occurs mainly in the June-July holiday period. It has been observed, judging from the findings, that benefits for all stakeholders of implementing this component are somehow not understood, which then results in drivers not fully implementing it.

Findings also revealed that placements in most sites becomes the duty of the WBE champions, which makes their task extremely difficult, more especially with the lack of full support from the work placement officers based in Central Office. In essence, a lot of work with regard to placements rests entirely on the shoulders of the placement officers rather than the lecturers, but when the latter have to do it, with no support, it becomes extremely difficult for the campuses to implement the WBE component fully.

4.3.3 The role of WBE champions in WBE implementation

The data presented in figure 4.3.3 indicates the WBE champions’ awareness of their role in the implementation process of WBE.

*Figure 4.3.3 Role of WBE champions in the implementation process*
Findings revealed that WBE champions on campuses are well aware of their role in WBE implementation owing to 100% positive response from respondents. This result indicates that there is a future for WBE. It was to be a serious cause for concern if the drivers of this component were not well aware of their role. That alone would have made implementation very difficult, and consequently prevented the desired outcomes from being attained.

As part of the implementation process, WBE champions facilitate students’ completion of WBE documentation. The 81% of the responses indicate that a lot is done by WBE champions in facilitating students’ completion of the documents relating to WBE. Only 19% of the responses were negative. The Council of Higher Education, CHE (2011) states that assessment of WBE, like assessment of theory and practice, must be based on the same principles underpinning assessment: appropriateness, fairness, transparency, validity, flexibility, practicability authenticity and consistency. The positive results imply that students’ workbooks are assessed accordingly.

However, WBE champions on sites are well aware of the role of the work-placement officers stationed in Central Office, and the importance of lines of communication being opened regarding WBE matters. On this item, 24% of the responses were positive, and a high percentage was negative. 76% of the respondents were not aware of the role of the work-placement officers stationed in Central Office. The results were a serious cause for concern. The main duty of the work-placement officers based in Central Office is to support the campuses on all WBE matters. If lines of communication are not opened, one will question the effectiveness of their role.
Washbourn (1996) proposes that learning on the job must be supported by induction of students and supervisors. WBE champions on site must be made aware of the role of the work-placement officials based in Central Office, in order for WBE implementation to yield the desired results. Another problem contributing to these results is the fact that there are no formal DHET systems in place for experiential workplace training, which gives rise to the lack of clear guidelines on the overall logistics, roles and responsibilities of all participants (Gewer, 2010).

Another interesting finding in the False Bay TVET College’s approach to Work Integrated Learning (WIL)/WBE revealed that WBE programme has been crafted with a special emphasis on enabling graduates to access employment. This is always at the back of the mind of every WBE champion as they execute their duties in assisting students to obtain relevant workplace exposure. The findings also revealed that the programme focuses on the following factors that are acute for success (Marock, 2015:7).

- The on-course WBE where students gain exposure and experience in genuine workplaces during their qualification.
- Ensuring that lecturers are suitably qualified and remain knowledgeable about the changing industry including Lecturer Workplace Exposure (Marock, 2015:7).

4.3.4 WBE assessment as part of managements’ role in implementation

The data presented in the figure below shows the documented monitoring of students’ workbooks as part of WBE assessment.

*Figure 4.3.4 Monitoring and support of WBE process*
As part of assessment, moderation of students’ workbooks is to be done and monitored by the campus management. Findings as per the figure above, revealed that there was not any substantial difference in numbers for this item, with 53% responses positive and 47% negative. These above figures indicate that moderation is not done at an acceptable level, and is clearly not monitored by the management at campus level. WBE, like the theoretical and practical components, must follow the same assessment criteria to be successful.

Once students have been sent for WBE, their reporting back, and review and evaluation of the process ought to be done by the campus management and WBE champions for future best practice. On this item there was not much variation in numbers, with 52% of responses being positive and 48% negative. This implies that it is uncertain who is responsible for this task between the WBE champions and the campus management, which is part of the reason it is not done. In order to pave the way forward, the SSACI (2012) and Buehring (2007) clearly assert that the onus rests on the campus management to embark on review and evaluation of the process.

As part of assessment, WBE champions support and monitor students during WBE, and the process is clearly scheduled and documented. Findings for this item revealed that 81% of responses were positive and 19% negative. The SSACI (2012) placement phase speaks of students being placed with host employers and monitored by the WBE champions and campus management during their placement. It is of vital importance that this monitoring is properly scheduled and documented for future reference and best practice.
Conversely, with WBE being incorporated in the campus calendar and composite timetable, an alarming 100% negative response for this item strongly indicates that WBE is not incorporated in the composite timetable. This may also indicate that this component in most campuses is not taken as seriously as theory and practice. The SSACI (2012) states that it is the duty of the college management to ascertain whether all students will be involved in WBE or not, and how WBE will be included in the college timetable. This will assist in effective monitoring of its implementation. In this instance, the college management was found wanting.

Taylor (2013) findings in the *Paper for National Skills Conference* revealed that integrating WBE in the NCV curriculum offers a sustainable solution to what would otherwise be a temporary intervention, over and above incorporating it in the college calendar. WBE must be assessed in order for it to be taken seriously by colleges and it increases the quality of the qualification.

The TASK books are designed in collaboration with colleges and guides workplaces and students on activities that must be completed during WBE. Students must provide evidence of their work experience and a completed task book does this. The ICASS task books are based on the generic task book format developed by SSACI (Taylor, 2013:7). The generic task books have been improved by adding a subject specific activity for each subject in a programme offering.

Vuoskoski & Poikela (2015) in *Issues in Education Research Paper* states that “individuals are learning throughout their lives and much of that takes place in the workplace, and in related learning settings”.

Findings in this paper accentuate that the assessment and evaluation system as a whole for workplacements and higher education learning environments should be more focused on learning and development, on multiple levels, and that a more holistic perspective towards development is also needed. It further highlights that the assessment and evaluation of workplacements is a fundamental part of higher education development, and that it is essential to take them into account during the curriculum planning phase, and its implementation into practice.

**4.3.5 Communication between relevant stakeholders**

Figure 4.3.5 shows the communication levels between the campus management and workplace officers centrally.
Findings revealed that communication between the campus management and work-placement officers based in central offices was not viewed as effective, as only 24% of responses were positive, and 76% disagreed that there was effective communication between the campus managers and work-placement officers. This is another serious cause for concern, as campus managers are the ones to answer any questions regarding WBE matters at their sites. Ineffective communication will result in ever-increasing problems with WBE implementation. If campuses are not supported by these officers, this component will suffer.

Marock (2015) findings in the *Understanding what makes for effective Youth Practice paper*, reveals that at least one Job Placement Officer is allocated to support specifically the Hospitality Programme students, who is available every Wednesdays, an interesting model of the communication between workplace officer and the college management.

### 4.3.5.1 Maintaining strong ties with the host employers

In order to ascertain that communication is made possible, strong ties should be maintained with the host employers, and exploratory meetings must be conducted with the potential new host employers. Findings revealed that 71% of respondents agreed on maintaining strong ties with host employers, and only 29% were negative.

Getting potential new host employers on board will alleviate the shortage of host employers to accommodate a huge percentage of students for experiential learning. This answers to the Department of Higher Education and Training/s concern that students’ lack of exposure to the
real work environment is a major burden for them in accessing employment opportunities (Mopani South East TVET College, 2012: 7).

Marock (2015:10) resonates the significance of maintaining strong ties with host employers, in an interview with the False Bay TVET College Muizenberg Campus Head of the Hospitality Department that:

“We now have 48 host employers for WBE in our database- the latest to come on board are the Food Lovers Market and several guesthouses in the area”

4.3.5.2 Reviving the campus Indaba committee

In order to ensure communication, the campus Indaba committee must assist with hosting students for WBE.

Findings revealed that 90% of the respondents indicated that the committee was working hard to ensure that students were assisted in securing placement for WBE. It also indicates that a lot is done at campus level by the campus management in ensuring that there is compliance. Only 10% of respondents were negative about the role of the campus Indaba committee, which is not a serious cause for concern.

The committee is a perfect platform since it links the campus with outside stakeholders, the very same employers to host students for WBE. This procedure is apparent in the Kenya Education Sector Support Programme (KESSP) in Nyerere (2009: 5), where it is stated that the aims of the TVET sector include the involvement of stakeholders in the development of a national skills training strategy. Stakeholders are also involved in starting mechanisms and appropriate incentives to promote sector investments in the development of TVET sector. According to Altinyelken (2004), “stakeholders must take hands in ensuring that TVET colleges’ students are afforded opportunities for pre-employment vocational training, on the job training and in-service training”.

Vision 2030 proposes the “enhancement of closer collaboration between industry and training institutions”. The Government of Kenya (GoK) has formulated “various policies on TVET
backed by strategies that revolve around promotion of partnerships among college stakeholders and equity in access and linkages and promotion of relevant skills development that meet the needs of the labour market”. The same goes for the South African TVET sector.

4.3.6 Informing students about available WBE opportunities

Most respondents agreed that students are informed about available WBE opportunities, and are assisted at campus level to plan and access them. In essence, that is mainly the responsibility of workplace officers based in central offices. Most respondents had an idea who the workplace officers were in their college. 14% had no idea, and 86% knew. The 14% of responses indicate that the officers are not visible enough to be known and not hands-on at campus level. They are the ones who are supposed to be the drivers of this component, so their role should be known. They must come down to campuses to give necessary support.

4.3.7 WBE budget as an integral part in implementation and compliance

Figure 4.3.7 below presents findings on proper planning of the WBE budget, to access timeously, Personal Protective Equipment (PPE) for students, travel allowances, Health and Safety Insurance, stipends for lecturers to support and monitor students during WBE and printing, stationery and medical examination expenses. Planning of the budget is vital to avoid unnecessary delays in procurement of the consumables for WBE and to cover costs to ensure that WBE is a success.

*Figure 4.3.7 Proper budget planning for WBE*
Concerning proper planning of WBE budgets to access timeously PPE for students, travel allowances, health and safety insurance, stipends for lecturers to support and monitor students during WBE, and printing, stationery and medical examination expenses, 38% of responses were positive and 62% negative, which reveals that there is no proper planning of WBE consumables, an indication that planning must be re-emphasised to avoid unnecessary delays and shortages in procuring them for effective implementation to take place.

However, concerning the plan in place to manage the risk of injury in the workplace, only 24% of the responses were positive and 76% negative, which strongly indicates that there is no plan in place to manage the risk of injury in the workplace.

The 24% of positive responses may indicate that the plan may be available but not effectively communicated from top-down, i.e., from college to campus level. Part of the preparation phase of WBE comprises a plan to be put in place to manage the risk of injury in the workplace, which is also part of the budget in the very first planning phase (SSACI, 2012). The SSACI (2012) projects’ very first phase in planning entails developing a WBE strategy and allocating a budget.

White paper on post schooling education and training (DHET, 2013) stipulates that the funding model should emphasise the objectives to grow and diversify the TVET sector, based on revised norms and standards.

It also emphasises the role of the managers to explore other sources of funding which include amongst others Sector Education and Training Authority (SETAs) and employers particularly for specific occupational programmes or short courses. It states that “The core funding will be made available by the DHET for staff, infrastructure and student support services to enable colleges to be responsive and dynamic” (DHET, 2013:18).

Findings in (Wolf, 2011) report provide some solutions to funding challenges: However, many of our vocational programmes are not good as they should, in terms of what either the labour market or higher education demand. These failures are not regardless of but because of central government’s constant redesign, re-regulation and re-organisation of education which covers academic as well as vocational subjects. This involves an overwhelming majority of the 14-19 year olds cohort.
4.3.8 Integration of WBE in the NCV curriculum to ensure compliance

Figure 4.3.8 indicates the integration of WBE in the NCV curriculum structure and its’ management. The positive and negative responses are graphically presented below. Findings also touch on management of WBE as a component of the NCV curriculum. Management is important to ensure compliance, without effective management integration cannot be realised.

Findings revealed that very few responses were negative, and 81% positive, which indicates that WBE is integrated in the NCV curriculum, and effectively managed. The DHET (2013) postulates that NCV was introduced with the main intention of responding to the national crisis of lack of skills and the ever-increasing demand by the South African government to combat that problem facing the South African economy. These results are a promising indication that something is being done at TVET colleges.

Respondents were also asked if they understood the importance of WBE in the NCV curriculum structure. Only 10% had no idea, and 90% respondents had some idea why WBE
is considered the most important component. Jackson (2013) believes that WBE programmes, if effectively implemented, can build students’ confidence, improve their appreciation of the importance of employable skills, and provide a valuable orientation to the world of work. This implies that if WBE is effectively implemented it can yield the desired results for its beneficiaries, who are all stakeholders involved in WBE.

4.4 AWARENESS OF POLICIES BEHIND WBE IMPLEMENTATION

Figure 4.4.1 indicates the awareness of the policies and projects in place for WBE implementation in TVET colleges, which are the NSDS 3 and the SSACI project. These policies form the base for implementation; without them there would be no standardisation.

The respondents were urged to rate their responses according to a “YES” column, which consists of the positive responses, and a “NO” column, which consists of negative responses in the frequency distribution table, and the data were presented in the graph below:

Figure 4.4.1 Awareness of WBE policies and implementation strategies

4.4.1 Role players’ awareness of WBE policies

Of the total number of respondents, 24% indicated that they were not aware of the policies in place for WBE implementation. The remaining 76% were aware, which is a good sign of compliance, since policies are the engine behind successful implementation of any project. WBE should be seen in the light of the new NSDS 3 (DHET, 2010: 6) wherein the government has indicated its seriousness about WBE programmes in educational institutions, including the
TVET sector, by launching the professional, vocational, technical and academic learning (PIVOTAL) programmes that aim to simplify students’ workplace experience, and establishing the new Directorate of Work-Integrated Learning under the Ministry of Education. Dr Blade Nzimande, the Minister of Higher Education and Training, launched the first draft of the Framework for National Skills Development 2011-2016 (DHET, 2010).

4.4.2 The significance of WBE training

As the WBE component and the TVET sector are new, constant training must be conducted to assist college employees to fully understand the sector as a whole, as well as NCV components. Another concern that was evident from the findings is that WBE officers based in central offices must be visible on campuses to give necessary support to the campus management and WBE champions. In 2012 about 48 TVET colleges management teams were trained, and a revised WBE manual came into place (SSACI, 2012).

Findings from the in-depth interviews revealed that as the respondents said, not enough training was conducted to assist the implementers to fully understand the programme, and therefore boost their confidence as they implement WBE. It is very sad to learn that implementers can be thrown into such a deep end, as the following WBE champions responded:

WBE champ 4: “I have never attended any training: I was thrown into the deep end as nobody in the programme was willing to assist.”

WBE champ 5: “I attended only one training about placing students and was shown the documents to fill for WBE. It was not training because I was not capacitated for WBE.”

It is evident from the above responses that in other sites WBE are just a paper exercise when an implementer is called for training, but is only shown documents to fill instead of being capacitated to gain confidence whilst complying with WBE implementation.

Most participants had had one training session four years previously, with no refresher training thereafter. Nor had there been training for the new college employees who were expected to run with the programme as the NCV curriculum structure stipulates.

Most respondents thought that both training and refresher training must be conducted on a regular basis, because new employees join the college owing (amongst other reasons) to resignations, transfers and college expansion of the programmes.
The newly appointed employees require training on WBE. A session once in seven years will not necessarily assist champions in understanding WBE as a component to be implemented. One interesting view shared by some respondents was that WBE champions must be trained in the industry set-up to be hands-on with the latest technology in order to align what they teach with what industry requires.

4.5 CHALLENGES IN THE IMPLEMENTATION PROCESS

4.5.1 The challenge of budget constraints to implement WBE

Findings with regard to WBE budget allocation showed that placing students near their homes can assist in reducing money for stipends, and where circumstances force students to travel to access host employers, they should receive a stipend.

Campus management should devise strategies to ensure that parents who can afford it should finance their children for WBE. This was a view shared by one campus manager:

CM 1: “There is a budget for WBE where a small stipend is given to students to cater for transport costs only, though students were asked to pay out of their own pockets, and the college reimbursed them at a later stage.”

CM 2: “Implementers on the ground take information from the workplace officials in Central Office. The WBE budget is in line with the SETAs budget, and it is not communicated how to integrate the budget needs of WBE and those of the College.”

The findings showed that most respondents thought that the WBE budget should be dealt with at campus level, as campuses have different numbers of students, with different geographical locations and socio-economic backgrounds.

If budget planning is dealt with at campus level it will assist in addressing the respondents’ concern about the lack of transparency in how the WBE budget is allocated per student. WBE champions shared their views on this:

WBE champ 6: “The campus is not responsible for the WBE budget. It is done at the college level by the WBE officials. There is no transparency in the way the WBE budget is managed.”
WBE champ 7: “Lecturers have no knowledge of WBE budget, I cannot comment as it is administered at college level. There is no transparency about how much is allocated to each student for WBE.”

WBE champ 10: “We do not deal with the budget as there are people employed to do that in Central Office. We act as a link between the campus and WBE officials.”

In order to address the funding problem, one senior lecturer interviewed suggested a very interesting method of accessing funds to assist needy students:

SL 5: “Campuses should fundraise to assist needy students by meeting them halfway. The college should request some form of budget from the SETAs to sponsor students for WBE.”

Wolf (2011) stressed that comprehensible programmes of learning and activity for all young people should be the centre of attention for educational institutions, and for funding oversight. In England, policy-making, funding and oversight should encourage that young people as the centre of attention for educational institutions (especially TVET institutions) rather than militating against it. This will be possible if the change from per-qualification to per-student funding is implemented, which exists for other levels of education, will not magically remove incentives to minimise effort and maximise revenue any more than it performs that miracle at university or school level. Wolf (2011: 120) states:

“But it will achieve something crucially important for the internal dynamics of an institutions, by focusing management and staff attention on student programmes rather the minutiae of individual qualification fees”

Wolf (2011) report also stresses the importance on funding for vocational students to be on a programme basis, with a given level of funding per student. A view also shared by WBE Champion 6 above.

4.5.2 The challenge of the shortage of host employers for a WBE programme

Findings revealed that not all levels of the NCV programme are prioritised for the WBE programme. This should not happen. Many respondents attribute this to the shortage of host employers for accommodating a whole lot of TVET college students.
Some respondents thought that placing students near where they stay could help address the difficulty of accessing a distant workplace. That could also help with paying for transport, which becomes a major problem for poor students. Another concern based on the findings was that strong ties ought to be maintained between the colleges and the existing host employers. An effort should also be made to recruit new host employers. Some interesting strategies were shared by the respondents below in helping deal with this problem.

**WBE champ 1:** “Only Level 4 students are sent for WBE. Level 2 and Level 3 are not sent for work exposure owing to the shortage of host employers.”

**WBE champ 2:** “Maybe we can look at the marketing department of the college where print media and radios can be used so that the college develops a lasting agreement with the host employers, the DHET and the Department of Labour. WBE must be made compulsory for all companies, and the government must subsidise WBE through a skills levy.”

**WBE champ 3:** “It is a difficult one as most students live far away from local host employers. Maybe looking for employers in the places closer to where students live may assist, and allowing students to look for their host employers may assist, too.”

Another interesting view was expressed by the respondent below.

**WBE champ 5:** “WBE officials must first confirm for the employer how this WBE will benefit the industry. That will make industries open doors for our students.”

One senior lecturer shared a view which could be of so much help if all relevant personnel supported it:

**SL 4:** “The campus should establish relationships with relevant host employers before placement by means of Open Days when host employers can be invited in order for them to feel part of a bigger family.”

Findings in (Marock, 2015) revealed that the challenge of the shortage of host employers affects most TVET colleges, however it is interesting to learn how the False Bay TVET College approach this aspect by encouraging their students to play an important role in identifying their own WBE host employers, and only turn to the Job Placement Department when they have exhausted other avenues in sourcing their own host employers. This view resonates with that of the WBE Champion 3 interviewed above.
Over and above that, another solution can be of valuable assistance in dealing with the challenge of the shortage of host-employers: that is to utilise ad-hoc work experience in addition to the normal structured three-week placements (Marock, 2015). Ad-hoc work experience will take students to work events and exhibitions, which provide a valuable experience and afford them additional training hours - False Bay TVET college initiative.

The college indicates that through some of these events, they are able to establish niche opportunities for graduates, some of which represent new areas of work. This view can be of benefit towards combating the challenge of the shortage of host employers. The similar view is shared in (Wolf, 2011) that, the labour market should understand the importance of genuine employment experience, and do far more than at present to help young people obtain it should be taken very serious. This view is shared by the WBE Champion: 5 above.

4.5.3 NCV curriculum critique by industries or host employer

It was apparent from the findings that one of the burning issues about the current TVET curriculum is that it is weak, and not flexible enough to meet the technological changes and diverse needs of different users, as Gewer (2010) asserts that “the quality of TVET graduates has declined in recent years owing to poor instructional methods, incompetent lecturers, outdated or inadequate training equipment, lack of meaningful work experience, and lack of supervision during attachment.

Findings confirmed that NCV is not understood by industries, which is part of the reason it is criticised, and not promoted. Most respondents thought that the NCV curriculum was supposed to be made known by industries from the very start, in order for them to have that sense of ownership which would result in support being given to the TVET colleges. It is relatively easy to give one’s support to a programme if one understands the benefits it yields, and if one is actively involved. This was found lacking, as is revealed in the following responses:

   WBE champ 9: “Some employers are struggling to even define what NCV is, to such an extent that they prefer Report 191 programmes, forgetting that N courses have no practical component, whereas NCV covers all three components.”

   WBE champ 10: “We understand NCV as lecturers, but the host employers do not.”

   WBE champ 12: “It should have been addressed a long time ago, because in the NCV curriculum, industries should have an input on what is to be taught. In doing so they
would have ownership. Vocational textbooks are written by authors with no industry experience. If technology advances textbooks become irrelevant, and so does what is taught in the TVET colleges.”

WBE champ 13: “Not a lot of marketing was done when the NCV programme was initially implemented. Part of the reason it is criticised is that its strengths and benefits are not known. There is still the negative perception that NCV is only for school dropouts, or those who have no way to go further with their studies.”

WBE champ 8: “The programme is new in the country, and the Department of Basic Education as the chief employer for the Early Childhood Development (ECD programme) is not fully aware of it.”

A serious cause for concern was revealed by the findings below, which raised eyebrows considering the fact that NCV was introduced in 2007. They indicate that the personnel responsible for marketing NCV to the relevant stakeholders did not do so very effectually. One wonders that ten years down the line, findings have revealed that.

SL 1: “We have some employers who do not even know what NCV stands for.”

SL 2: “I believe the criticism because I have encountered it whilst speaking with the host employer because they do not understand NCV as they understand Report 191.”

These responses are similar to the ones given by the WBE champions above. It remains the responsibility of the college to ensure that students are supplied with necessary protective clothes, not only for WBE but also for the practical training centres where they are taken for the practical component. It is irresponsible, said WBE champion 2, to send students for work experience without the necessary equipment, especially that which has to do with their safety.

WBE champ 1: “Some companies have different safety measures. For example, they require students to have protective clothes before they can be given any work exposure. The College must place orders for Personal Protective Clothes (PPEs) before students are placed for relevant work exposure.”
There were no placement requirements when NCV was first introduced. The only requirement for the learner to enrol for NCV was a Grade 9 pass in the General Education and Training (GET) band, which was a challenge on its own.

One can argue that a Grade 9 learner is not mature enough to face the challenges of the complex curriculum in the NCV programme. This coincides with the view of the champion below that the first intake of NCV was just for filling up the programme. However, on a positive note, what raises hope about NCV is the response from one WBE champion concerning noticeable changes observed from the year 2013:

\[ WBE\text{ champ}\ 11:\ "In\ the\ beginning\ the\ industrial\ world\ had\ no\ understanding\ of\ NCV.\ The\ first\ intake\ of\ the\ NCV\ was\ just\ for\ filling\ up\ the\ programme;\ but\ later\ on\ relevant\ placements\ were\ made\ to\ suit\ industry’s\ expectations.\ From\ 2013\ to\ 2015\ the\ college\ received\ good\ reports\ about\ the\ NCV\ programme\ from\ industry” \]

Wolf (2011) findings revealed that there is a mismatch between labour market requirements and vocational education provision. Furthermore, it is revealed that things have got worse in part because of education and training policies which are at odds with labour market dynamics. It is stated in the report that, at present England’s vocational education provision is seriously ill-aligned in some key respects, especially within post-16 provision where the TVET sector is mostly featured. This is also the case with South Africa.

In addition to that (Marock, 2015) similarly puts an emphasis on ensuring that the learning programmes are relevant to the needs of industry. Employers and former students have raised particular concerns about the relevance of the college learning programmes, including the need for more practical experience, and even greater emphasis on the soft-skills especially communication skills within the Hospitality industry. A very interesting concern was shared in an interview with the Deputy General Manager at the St James Retirement Hotel (Marock, 2015:26):

\[ "If I knew more about what they are doing at the college, e.g. what the curriculum looks like, I would be able to advise and give more input” \]
The college also notes that the structure and fixed-nature of the learning programme curricula impact on their relevance to industry’s needs. Marock (2015:24) in an interview with the False Bay TVET College Academic Head: NCV & NATED Programmes, the importance of program relevancy is highlighted below:

“Ensuring that our programmes are relevant to employer’s needs and to available employment opportunities can be a challenge because both the NCV and NATED (N1-N6) programmes are set curriculums, and we have a responsibility to prepare the students for the examinations. So we really need to find a balance between exams/curriculum and work-readiness. This is where our subject-matter experts, and how we allocate our lecturers with industry experience, become really important...You start to know where each lecturer has a particular expertise and specialisation, and allocate them to their area of expertise”

4.5.4 Challenges hindering WBE implementation

The findings revealed that shortage of host employers on account of the geographical location of the campuses makes it very hard for students to reach employers as they are far from where they stay. It was also clear that it is unfair to reduce the number of days for workplace exposure to a mere week for NQF Level 4 students in contrast to the minimum of three weeks of an ideal placement period as Level 4 students spend 15 days in workplaces. The placement of all students occurs mainly in the June-July holidays. One senior lecturer responded:

SL 1: “One of the challenges is that students cannot afford to go to the workplace, so the college must look at a small stipend. For me one week for work exposure is just a paper exercise.”

The growing number of students in the TVET sector makes it even more difficult for the sector to afford all students at all levels a chance for workplace exposure, as campuses share floor space to host students for WBE.

The attitude of students towards the experience and the attitudes they encounter in the workplace are other causes for concern for some respondents, especially where some employers feel that having students is a waste of time, forgetting that experience cannot be
bought. Some employers treat logbooks as a paper exercise, thus do not give their all. And as SL 4 said:

“Some students do not take WBE seriously: they easily absent themselves from work.”

Marock (2015) also shared an important view about the consequences of failing to manage students’ attitudes and expectations as learners’ attitudes can have an enormous impact on the college’s relationships with host employers. When students go into the workplace with the negative attitudes and/or underperform, employers are reluctant to host more students and can even withdraw from the process.

A disturbing observation made by WBE champions was that some employers treat students as cheap labour to help them raise their productivity by only emphasising production at the expense of the students exploring the industry and obtaining relevant experience.

WBE champions and campus management had the same views with regard to the duties of WBE officials. It was evident from their responses that very little have been done by these officials to ensure effective WBE implementation on campus. The respondents believed that to be a major challenges:

SL 3: “The College has employed two WBE officials who do not understand the programme. The WBE officials’ duty, amongst others, is to show the host employers how WBE is a win-win situation, how it will benefit both parties involved.”

WBE champ 4: “WBE officials based at Central Office have no knowledge of industry. Ideally there should be officials to service each campus, as the ones based centrally only service some campuses at the expense of others.”

4.6 CONCLUSION

The chapter has provided an in-depth elaboration of results based on the findings obtained from the fieldwork. It is clear that WBE is not effectively implemented. Some findings revealed that on some campuses it is just a paper exercise. The criticism of the NCV was confirmed by
respondents as a very disturbing factor if they are sending students out for workplace exposure, as many industry people seem not to understand it.

The DHET stresses the importance of WBE for students. Ignorance of the policies of the college/campus management results in the vision for WBE, action plans and college WBE strategy not being fully developed. Another alarming finding was the lack of monitoring and evaluation of WBE. As WBE is part of the NCV curriculum structure it must be assessed and monitored.

The shortage of host employers was another reason for the failure to fully implement NCV. Since the NCV curriculum is relatively new, training is necessary for implementers on the ground to know how the component works. Lack of full support from the campus management and WBE officers in central office makes implementing this component extremely difficult.

The final chapter provides the summary, conclusions and recommendations of the study.
CHAPTER 5

SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter summarises the research findings and suggests the recommendations that could be of benefit for further research in this area of ensuring compliance of the TVET colleges with the implementation of WBE for students.

The objectives of the study were:

1. To determine the role of college management teams in ensuring compliance with the vocational curriculum structure offering WBE for students.
2. To determine college management awareness of the National Strategy and the SSACI initiative for WBE implementation in the TVET colleges,
3. To identify the challenges encountered by the TVET colleges’ management in ensuring compliance with the National Strategy and SSACI initiative.

INTENDED CONTRIBUTION TO THE BODY OF KNOWLEDGE

The contribution to knowledge of the present study is envisioned as follows:

- The findings will assist in deciding on an implementation policy for WBE, and how students will be evaluated and supported.
- The study affirms that WBE can be successful if given the same weighting with the other curriculum component, which is theory and practice.
- The study provides feedback to TVET curriculum developers on the implementation of the NCV curriculum, thus enabling them to address any problem uncovered.

5.2 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

5.2.1 The role of the college management in the effective implementation of WBE

*Campus management support of WBE implementation at their sites*
It was discovered from the data analysed that the college management does not give necessary support to the implementers of the WBE programme. It was also discovered that the college management seem not to understand their role in ensuring compliance with regard to WBE implementation. According to the profiled lecturer qualifications, most participants hold bachelor and postgraduate degrees, which make them suitably qualified to implement WBE; but without the support of the college management they might not succeed.

This study also revealed that lack of industrial experience for implementers at the top level poses another serious cause for concern. It was noticeable from the findings that there is a clear vision for WBE implementation, but it is not being explicitly communicated to the role players. Some of them have no idea of its existence. Campus management should be blamed in this instance, as they are responsible for ensuring that the vision is known to the role players. It is not enough to have it neatly written and filed, but not communicated to the implementers. It was also discovered that the WBE strategy is not fully enforced at campus level, partly because it is not known or well communicated. The same goes for the action plans: the results revealed that most respondents have absolutely no idea of them.

*The role of WBE champions in WBE implementation*

This study revealed that some WBE officials are not aware of the policies in place for WBE, which is partly why the vision for implementation is not clearly communicated. One concludes that there is some kind of thumb sucking involved if implementation is not based on the proper policies and procedures.

*WBE assessment as part of management*

The findings show that WBE is not incorporated in the college calendar: only vacations are used for this programme. If it cannot be implemented then, the chances are that it will not be done at all, and implementers may embark on a mere paper exercise, which defeats the purpose of the programme. There is no clear indication of who, between the WBE champions and campus management, is responsible for some tasks in the assessment of WBE.

Findings revealed that the responsibility rests on the shoulders of the WBE champions. One can conclude that sometimes the campus management leave their duties to be done by the WBE champions, which is not fair.
Findings also revealed that monitoring, moderation, review and evaluation are not done to an acceptable standard, which indicates that, like other assessments, WBE assessment is not monitored by the college management, but is merely a paper exercise. It appears that the college management do not fully understand their responsibilities in ensuring compliance with this programme.

*Communication between relevant stakeholders to ensure compliance*

Most respondents seem to understand the importance and benefit of having WBE as a component in the NCV curriculum. It was evident that there is a need not only to maintain strong ties with existing host employers, but also to ensure that new host employers are recruited to help alleviate the shortage of them. The availability and effectiveness of the campus Indaba committee across the campuses was evident in the findings, which revealed many success stories of the committee assisting in placing students for work exposure. Students are well informed, mostly by the WBE champions on site, about the availability of WBE opportunities. They are encouraged to take advantage of such opportunities after the campus management informs them about the benefits of obtaining such experience. However, WBE officials in Central Office are not visible to give necessary support to WBE officials at campus level, an observation made by most respondents. These officials’ role in implementation was questioned, because they appear to be doing little or nothing to carry out their duties.

*Integration of WBE in the NCV curriculum to ensure compliance*

This study revealed that NCV NQF Level 4 students are prioritised for WBE exposure, but NQF Levels 2 and 3 are being ignored, partly because of the exit level of the NCV programme. One concludes that implementation is essential at this exit level, but it is very easy at this stage to treat WBE as a mere paper exercise. It was also discovered that most respondents have some understanding of the importance of WBE, which is a shift in the right direction towards compliance and effective implementation, even though there is not much awareness of the policies.

*WBE budget planning as an integral part in implementation and compliance*

Another major cause for concern in the findings was the WBE budget, which is not dealt with at campus level, but centralised, and therefore not transparent in as much as its allocation per campus is concerned.
5.2.2 College management awareness of policies behind WBE implementation

Policies awareness

It was discovered from the findings that quite a number of respondents were not aware of the policies in place for WBE implementation. Awareness is a key towards effective implementation; if most respondents are uninformed, that is a serious cause for concern. In Chapter Two, where literature was reviewed, the Department of Higher Education and Training indicated that students’ lack of exposure to the real work environment is a major disadvantage in trying to find work (Mopani South East TVET College, 2012: 7). WBE officers based in Central Office are not visible enough on campuses to give necessary support in clarifying the policies behind WBE implementation.

Significance of WBE training

This study revealed that no regular training was provided for implementers of WBE, especially the hands-on ones like WBE champions. Some findings revealed a dire need for training in the programme in order to gain support from those involved in WBE, by giving them a full understanding of its benefits. DHET (2010) speaks of the college management having to fully accept the WBE programme to ensure implementation, including partnerships with industries and host employers. Most respondents have attended training and seminars for WBE implementation, but there was no refresher training, or special training organised for newly appointed staff members. Part of the reason they feel thrown into the deep end has to implement something they do not fully understand.

5.2.3 Challenges encountered in implementation of and compliance with WBE

The challenge of budget constraints to implement WBE

It was noticeable from the findings that placing students near their homes was seen as a way to save money. Training students, and familiarising them with the workplace before placement was also seen as a way of assisting students to gain valuable experience, and strengthen the relationship between the college and the host employers, as the reputation of the college students goes a long way to secure permanent employment for them.
This study also strongly revealed that there is no transparency in the way the WBE budget is administered, no proper planning of the budget (which is not administered on site but controlled centrally), and no workable plan in place to manage finances. Other major problems encountered are shortage of money, the WBE budget, and the geographical location of campuses, which is the reason for prioritising Level 4 students at the expense of Level 2 and Level 3 students, and is a serious cause for concern, as the component applies to all NCV levels, not only Level 4. Level 2 and Level 3 students are thereby robbed of a valuable opportunity for work exposure.

The shortage of host employers for WBE programmes

This study indicated a pressing need to maintain mutually beneficial relationships between the college and the host employers, in order to secure the latter to assist in hosting students for WBE, especially because of the increasing numbers for the NCV in TVET colleges across the country. Implementers should spell out the benefits for WBE and ensure that they are understood by the role players.

NCV curriculum critique by industries/host employers

It was evident in this study that criticism of the NCV curriculum by industries is another cause for concern, which necessitates the need for engagement with the relevant stakeholders. The DHET, TVET college managements, the Department of Labour, SETAs and all other relevant stakeholders ought to educate industries in how the curriculum works, and what its benefits are.

5.3 DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS IN CONNECTION WITH THE RESEARCH TOPIC

The main aim of this study was to determine whether the TVET colleges’ NCV curriculum structure complies with the national strategy and policy stipulations in offering WBE for students. The problem statement highlighted in Chapter One revealed that, as set out in the national strategy, every student who exits the TVET sector must have received some kind of WBE exposure. If the TVET colleges do not make an effort to implement WBE, students will be robbed of an opportunity to improve their chances of employment. WBE is one of the components in the TVET NVC curriculum structure, which is of fundamental importance in ensuring that students are thoroughly prepared for a better fit in the world of work.
The careful analysis of literature in Chapter Two formed a basis for discovering a theoretical framework (which outlines the work of various theorists). Chapter Three focused on data collection and analysis based on the research questions. Chapter Four presents the summary of findings which formed the basis for drawing the following sound conclusions about the compliance of technical and vocational education and training colleges’ curriculum implementation with the national strategy and policy.

5.4 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

This study, like all others, was not embarked on without limitations. Shortage of money limited the selection of the sample for this study. As a result, the findings presented cannot be generalised. Another limitation to this study is that there are not enough studies done on curriculum implementation and WBE of the TVET sector.

5.5 CONCLUSION

The results of this study show that the TVET college managements as process owners and implementers were found wanting with regard to the compliance levels required in implementing WBE as the third component of the NCV curriculum structure.

Compliance entails implementing all three components – theory, practice and WBE – equally. However, findings revealed that although on some campuses something is done towards compliance with WBE, it is done under very demotivating budget constraints; policies are not clearly defined and communicated; there is meagre training for the implementers; the NCV curriculum is criticised by industries; there is a shortage of employers to host students for work experience; and WBE officials bring no experience of industry to the task of supporting WBE champions on campuses. WBE must also be seen in the light of the new NSDS 3 (DHET, 2010: 6), wherein the government has indicated its seriousness about WBE programmes in educational institutions, including the TVET sector, by launching the professional, vocational, technical and academic learning (PIVOTAL) programmes that aim to simplify students’ workplace experience, and establishing the new Directorate of Work Integrated Learning (WIL), which falls under the Ministry of Education. This all serves to indicate the determination of the Department of Higher Education in seeing to it that WBE is implemented.
The Department of Higher Education and Training (DHET) had recognised that lack of students’ exposure to the real work environment is a major burden for students in finding work (Mopani South East TVET College, 2012: 7). If this problem is not addressed, South Africa may continue facing the problem of a huge number of unemployed graduates. This was confirmed by the Minister of Higher Education and Training, Dr Blade Nzimande, in his keynote address at the launch of the Quality Council for Trades and Occupations, when he said: “We know that college training is, on its own, not enough. If work training does not complement the learning done at colleges, we could well find that the young stars we work so hard to train remain unemployed after they qualify” (SSACI, 2012: 5).

“Tell me, and I forget. Teach me and I remember. Involve me and I learn.” Confucius, 450 B.C.

This often quoted declaration speaks to the importance of necessitating learning by doing, which has a lot to do with ensuring that there is an effective connection between college life and working life or workplace experience. Theory and practical knowledge alone are not enough to ensure that students are employable after graduating from the TVET sector, but being actively exposed to the workplace environment can help to make them easily employable.

The TVET colleges in South Africa were initially established as one of the national strategies for tackling skills shortages, job creation and economic growth. This, it is hoped, automatically translates into employability. There are success stories of the increase in enrolments since the sector’s inception, which implies the colleges’ popularity. However, the success indicator of the TVET sector is not only the enrolment figures but the employability of its graduates. But students’ ability to find jobs is limited by the lack of workplace exposure and the shortage of workplaces, mostly in the rural areas. WBE is one component to help address that challenge, hence the benefits highlighted in previous chapters.

Countries like Switzerland and Germany that have a very low unemployment rate show that employers are integral to the TVET system and qualifications must include workplace experience in order to increase students’ success in employment. International Labour Organisation (ILO), 2015
5.6 RECOMMENDATIONS

5.6.1 Recommendations related to the study

1. The WBE budget should be administered transparently and DHET, SETAs, the Department of Labour and relevant WBE stakeholders should all contribute towards dealing with budget constraints.

2. The criticisms of the NCV curriculum by industries and the DHET should be reconsidered, as should the colleges’ marketing of the NCV. Industries should be consulted on the NCV curriculum to ensure that colleges teach students knowledge and skills that are relevant to industries’ needs.

3. Further research is recommended on WBE assessment as a component in the NCV curriculum structure, monitoring and evaluation of WBE assessment as the other two NCV components which are theory and practical.

5.6.2 Recommendations for the study

1. There should be a clear vision in place for WBE implementation, and it should be clearly communicated to all role players to ensure effective implementation of the programme.

2. College managements need to support implementation of WBE on campuses in close collaboration with the WBE officials in Central Office to ensure that they are visible on campus to support the campus management and WBE champions. WBE officials must possess a certain degree of industrial experience in order to understand what sector they are sending students to for work exposure.

3. Other levels must come on board, so that not only Level 4 is prioritised for WBE (though it may be on a smaller scale), so that by the time students reach Level 4 they have an idea of and respect for the workplace.

4. Mutually beneficial relationships should be maintained between the TVET colleges and the host employers.
   Implementers should be trained on a regular basis since industrial technology is advancing, and students must be taught what is relevant to the workplace.
REFERENCES


ANNEXURE A

LETTER SEEKING FOR PERMISSION TO CONDUCT RESEARCH
Re: REQUEST FOR A PERMISSION TO CONDUCT RESEARCH IN CAMPUSES OF UMFOLOZI TVET COLLEGE

I am a registered Master’s student at the University of Zululand hereby request a permission to conduct research in Campuses under Umfolozi TVET College. This research is part of the study pursued towards a Master’s Degree in Curriculum and Instructional Studies, with the University of Zululand. Five Campuses will be targeted for this research namely, Mandeni, Eshowe, Esikhawini, Richtek and Chief Albert Luthuli Campus. I will be administering questionnaires. I will interview Campus Managers, Senior Lectures/Head of Units as well as WBE champions of different programmes, on the compliance of the TVET colleges’ NC (V) curriculum implementation with the national strategy and policy. The main focus will be on the implementation of WBE in the college. Some workplaces or hosts employers will be visited for the purpose of WBE observation. The proposed data collection period will cover the beginning of third term of the NC (V) calendar.

I am therefore requesting your kind approval to conduct the study and a letter of introduction to Campus Managers to facilitate my gaining access to the respective Campuses and meeting the participants for this study.
Furthermore, I would appreciate if you can nominate a contact person within the College to liaise with for successful conduct of the study, preferably personnel from WBE office. Should you require any more clarification about this research, I could be contacted through my cell phone number: 072 612 8849 or preferably through my e-mail address: pmangubs@gmail.com. Attached here-under is a summary of my proposal outlining the major phases in the research and the research ethics.

Thanking you in advance.

Your co-operation in this regard will be highly appreciated.

Yours sincerely

------------------
Ngubane P.B, Senior Lecturer (Fundamentals) at Mandeni Campus.
Supervisors: Dr D.W Mncube and Co-supervisor Dr M.S Mabusela.
ANNEXURE B

LETTER GRANTING PERMISSION TO CONDUCT RESEARCH
08 July 2015

TO WHOM IT MAY CONCERN:

The purpose of this letter is to grant permission to NGUBANE PHIWOKUHLE BONGIWE

As per the request to conduct the research project:

**Research Project Title:** Compliance of Technical and Vocational Education and Training Colleges’ curriculum implementation with the National Strategy and policy.

**Aim of the Research:** The main aim of the study is to determine whether the TVET colleges' curriculum structure complies with the National strategy and policy stipulations in implementing WBE for students.

**Tertiary Institution:** UNIVERSITY OF ZULULAND

**Faculty:** EDUCATION CURRICULUM & INSTRUCTIONAL STUDIES

**Qualification:** MASTER IN EDUCATION

**Name of Supervisor:** Dr D W MNCUBE

**Study Site Location:** Umfolozi TVET College, Mandeni and Esikhawini Campus

**Consent of participants:** All participants must be given consent forms to sign before the commencement of study.

**Confidentiality:** All participants must be guaranteed confidentiality

**Permission granted by:**

[Signature]

SZ ZUNGU
PRINCIPAL
ANNEXURE C

QUESTIONNAIRE
INTRODUCTION

This questionnaire aims at collecting data from you as Campus Manager, Senior Lecturer and WBE champion, regarding your views about the compliance of Technical and Vocational Education and Training colleges’ curriculum implementation with the National strategy and policy. The data that you provide will remain confidential and anonymous, therefore, you do not have to write your name in this questionnaire. Please respond as honestly as you can. There is no right or wrong answer; it all depends on your views.

Please answer the following questions by putting a (X) in the box that corresponds to your answer:

SECTION A

LECTURER’S PROFILE

1. Lecturer’s Qualification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Qualification</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Matric/Grade 12/ N3</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matric + N4-N6 certificates</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Diploma/Diploma</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degree</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post graduate Degree</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. Lecturing/Teaching Experience (Years)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years</th>
<th>√</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Years 0-2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Years 3-4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Years 5-10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Years 11+</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. Levels lectured by the respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>√</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Level 2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level 3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level 4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Role of respondents in WBE implementation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>√</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WBE Champions(Lecturers)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Campus Managers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior Lecturers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. Location of campuses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>√</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semi-urban</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other(specify)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SECTION B

The following statements are designed to seek your views regarding your views about the role of the college management in ensuring compliance in offering WBE for students. For each statement put a cross(X) on a category which best describes your view, according to the following Likert Scale.

SA= Strongly Agree

A= Agree

D=Disagree

SD=Strongly Disagree

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO.</th>
<th>ITEM DESCRIPTION</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Campus manager fully supports WBE implementation in this site.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>There is a clear vision for WBE implementation in this Campus</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Strong ties are maintained with the host employers and exploratory meetings are</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
conducted with the potential new host employers.

4. The campus Indaba committee is alive and assist with hosting students for WBE.

5. Visit to the host employer is made possible through assigned personnel to monitor attendance and progress of the students placed.

6. The WBE strategy of the college is enforced in campuses by the campus management.

7. Action plans are well developed to guide the implementation of WBE.

8. WBE champions in the campus are well aware of their role in the implementation process of WBE.

9. WBE champions on site are aware of the role of the work-placement officers stationed in Central Office and the lines of communication are opened regarding WBE matters.

10. WBE is incorporated in the campus calendar and composite time table.

11. There is an effective communication between the campus managers and Work-placement officers in Central Office.

12. Debriefing sessions, logbooks and stipends is well managed at college level in order to
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>124</td>
<td>facilitate an easy access of the host employers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students are informed about available WBE opportunities and are assisted at campus level to plan and access them</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>WBE champions facilitate students’ completion of WBE documentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>There is a plan in place to manage the risk of injury in the workplace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Moderation of students’ workbooks is done and monitored by the campus management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>Reporting back of students, review and evaluation of the process is done by the campus management and WBE champions for future best practices.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>There is proper planning of the WBE budget, to access timeously PPE for students, travel allowances, Health and Safety insurance, stipends for lecturers to support and monitor students during WBE and printing, stationery and medical examination expenses.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>WBE champions support and monitor students during WBE and that monitoring process is well-scheduled and documented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>Implementation of WBE activities is managed and monitored in line with the college action plan.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SECTION C

The following questions seek information based on your awareness and knowledge of the National Skills Development Strategy 3 (NSDS 3) and the SSACI initiative for WBE implementation in TVET colleges. Please answer the following questions by crossing Yes OR No in the box and elaborate on the provided spaces where necessary.

Is the college management aware of the National strategy policy (NSDS 3) and SSACI initiative as the initiative in place for implementation of WBE in TVET colleges?

1. Are you aware of the National strategy NSDS 3 and the SSACI initiative for WBE implementation for TVET colleges?
   YES
   NO

   Please justify your answer.
   ____________________________________________________________
   ____________________________________________________________
   ____________________________________________________________

2. Do you have any idea of who are the Work-placement officers responsible for WBE in this College? Do you perhaps have any understanding of their role?
   YES
   NO

   Please justify your answer.
   ____________________________________________________________
   ____________________________________________________________
   ____________________________________________________________
3. Do you have any idea of how NCV curriculum structure is shaped?

| YES | NO |

Please support your answer.

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

4. Do you have any idea why WBE/WIL is the most important component in the NCV curriculum structure?

| YES | NO |

Please elaborate on the importance if the answer is YES.

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

5. Have you ever attended any WBE training or information session?

| YES | NO |

If the answer is YES, please elaborate on the best practices one can obtain from such a training.

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________
6. Do you have any idea of who are the host employers in your programme /unit /campus?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YES</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If the answer is YES please share more light on ways of accessing host employers.

________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
ANNEXURE D

INTERVIEW SCHEDULE
## INTERVIEW SCHEDULE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Campus</th>
<th>Respondent's Designation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>15/02/16</td>
<td>14:00-14:50</td>
<td>Esikhawini Campus</td>
<td>CM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15/02/16</td>
<td>15:00-16:00</td>
<td>Esikhawini Campus</td>
<td>SL 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16/02/16</td>
<td>11:00-11:50</td>
<td>Esikhawini Campus</td>
<td>SL 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16/02/16</td>
<td>12:00-13:00</td>
<td>Esikhawini Campus</td>
<td>SL 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17/02/16</td>
<td>11:30-13:20</td>
<td>Esikhawini Campus</td>
<td>WBE Champ 1&amp;2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17/02/16</td>
<td>13:30:15:30</td>
<td>Esikhawini Campus</td>
<td>WBE Champ 3&amp;4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17/02/16</td>
<td>15:30:17:30</td>
<td>Esikhawini Campus</td>
<td>WBE Champ 5&amp;6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23/02/16</td>
<td>12:00:13:00</td>
<td>Mandeni Campus</td>
<td>CM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23/02/16</td>
<td>13:00-14:00</td>
<td>Mandeni Campus</td>
<td>SL 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24/02/16</td>
<td>10:00-11:00</td>
<td>Mandeni Campus</td>
<td>SL 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24/02/16</td>
<td>14:00-15:00</td>
<td>Mandeni Campus</td>
<td>SL 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25/02/16</td>
<td>12:00-14:00</td>
<td>Mandeni Campus</td>
<td>WBE Champ 1&amp;2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25/02/16</td>
<td>14:15-16:15</td>
<td>Mandeni Campus</td>
<td>WBE Champ 3&amp;4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26/02/16</td>
<td>10:00-13:00</td>
<td>Mandeni Campus</td>
<td>WBE Champ 5,6&amp;7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SECTION D (INTERVIEWS)

The following questions are designed to seek your views about the challenges the TVET colleges’ management encounter in WBE implementation. Please respond to the questions as honestly as you can.

1. Has this campus optimally implemented WBE to assist students to obtain relevant work exposure and experience?

2. What are the most noticeable setbacks which hinder WBE implementation in this Campus? Do you have any suggestions on how to address them?

3. Do you have any ideas on how to address the challenge of the shortage of host employers for WBE programme?

4. How does this campus deal with the challenge of budget constraints to implement WBE? Briefly elaborate.

5. NCV curriculum has been criticized by host employers, mainly due to the lack of knowledge on how it works. What are your views in dealing with this critique?

6. Have you ever attended any WBE training or information session in this college/campus? What are your views on the significance of such training?
ANNEXURE E

STANDARD ETHICS PROTOCOL
STANDARD ETHICS PROTOCOL

My name is P.B Ngubane. I am a researcher on the study entitled: Compliance of Technical and Vocational Education and Training colleges’ curriculum implementation with the National strategy and policy. This study is supervised by Dr D.W Mncube of the University of Zululand. Dr D.W Mncube can be contacted at this phone number: 0829324338 should you have any clarity seeking questions.

Thank you for your willingness to participate in this research. Your participation is extremely appreciated. Before we commence with the interviews, I would like to reassure you that as a participant in this research, you have several very definite ethical rights namely:

- Voluntary participation.
- Freedom to refuse to answer any question at any time.
- Freedom to withdraw from the interview at any time.
- The confidentiality aspect of the interviews.
- Debriefing will be offered to the client after the interviewing session.
- Freedom of using language of your choice.

Excerpts of this interview will be made part of the mini-dissertation, but under no circumstances will your name or identifying characteristics be included in the Mini-dissertation.

Please sign below if you have read and also understood the researcher’s explanation of the content of the research ethics protocol.

____________________________________ (signed)

____________________________________ (Printed)
ANNEXURE F

INFORMED CONSENT

DECLARATION
PARTICIPANT INFORMED CONSENT DECLARATION

INFORMED CONSENT DECLARATION

(Participant)

Project Title: Compliance of Technical and Vocational Education and Training colleges’ curriculum implementation with the National strategy and policy, from Curriculum & Instructional Studies Department, the University of Zululand has requested my permission to participate in the above-mentioned research project. The nature and the purpose of the research project and of this informed consent declaration have been explained to me in a language that I understand.

I am aware that the purpose of the research project is to investigate Compliance of Technical and Vocational Education and Training colleges’ curriculum implementation with the National strategy and policy. The study seeks to come up with comprehensive strategies to improve implementation of Workplace Based Education and assist the TVET to work in harmony with industries in providing practical skills training for student.

2. The University of Zululand has given ethical clearance to this research project and I have seen/ may request to see the clearance certificate.

3. By participating in this research project I will be contributing towards the deeper understanding how TVET colleges can better respond to the challenge facing work integrated learning (WIL). There seem to be systematic factors that need to be unlocked to open doors in order to harness the skill of students.

4. I will participate in the project by responding to interview questions, filling of questionnaire, and offering any evidence that you might have of assistance to this study.

5. My participation is entirely voluntary and should I at any stage wish to withdraw from participating further, I may do so without any negative consequences.
6. I will not be compensated for participating in the research, but my out-of-pocket expenses will be reimbursed.

7. There may be risks associated with my participation in the project. I am aware that

   a) the following risks are associated with my participation: information disclosure and identification of the participants
   b) the following steps have been taken to prevent the risks: consideration of ethical issues.
   c) there is a 5% chance of the risk materialising

8. The researcher intends publishing the research results in the form of a journal article. However, confidentiality and anonymity of records will be maintained and that my name and identity will not be revealed to anyone who has not been involved in the conduct of the research.

9. I will receive feedback in the form of empirical findings and access to the copy of this report regarding the results obtained during the study.

10. Any further questions that you might have concerning the research or my participation will be answered by Ms P.B Ngubane on the following mobile number: 0726128849 or email address: phiwokuhle.ngubane@umfolozi.edu.za or pmangubs@gmail.com

11. By signing this informed consent declaration I am not waiving any legal claims, rights or remedies.
12. A copy of this informed consent declaration will be given to me, and the original will be kept on record.

I, ………………………………………………………………….have read the above information / confirm that the above information has been explained to me in a language that I understand and I am aware of this document’s contents. I have asked all questions that I wished to ask and these have been answered to my satisfaction. I fully understand what is expected of me during the research.

I have not been pressurised in any way and I voluntarily agree to participate in the above-mentioned project.

…………………………………  ……………………………………
Participant’s signature    Date
ANNEXURE G
ETHICAL CLEARANCE CERTIFICATE
ETHICAL CLEARANCE CERTIFICATE

Certificate Number: UZREC 171110-030 PGM 2015/239

Project Title: Compliance if technical and vocational education and training colleges curriculum implementation with the National Strategy and policy

Principal Researcher/Investigator: PB Ngubane

Supervisor and Co-supervisor: Dr DW Mncube, Dr SM Mabuseia

Department: Curriculum & Instructional Studies

Nature of Project: Honours/4th Year | Master's | x | Doctoral | Departmental

The University of Zululand's Research Ethics Committee (UZREC) hereby gives ethical approval in respect of the undertakings contained in the above-mentioned project proposal and the documents listed on page 2 of this Certificate.

Special conditions:

1. The Principal Researcher must report to the UZREC in the prescribed format, where applicable, annually and at the end of the project, in respect of ethical compliance.

2. Documents marked "To be submitted" (see page 2) must be presented for ethical clearance before any data collection can commence.

The Researcher may therefore commence with the research as from the date of this Certificate, using the reference number indicated above, but may not conduct any data collection using research instruments that are yet to be approved.

Please note that the UZREC must be informed immediately of

- Any material change in the conditions or undertakings mentioned in the documents that were presented to the UZREC
- Any material breaches of ethical undertakings or events that impact upon the ethical conduct of the research
Classification:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data collection</th>
<th>Animals</th>
<th>Human Health</th>
<th>Children</th>
<th>Vulnerable pp.</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Low Risk</th>
<th>Medium Risk</th>
<th>High Risk</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table below indicates which documents the UZREC considered in granting this Certificate and which documents, if any, still require ethical clearance. (Please note that this is not a closed list and should new instruments be developed, these would require approval.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Documents</th>
<th>Considered</th>
<th>To be submitted</th>
<th>Not required</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Faculty Research Ethics Committee recommendation</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Animal Research Ethics Committee recommendation</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Research Ethics Committee recommendation</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethical clearance application form</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project registration proposal</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informed consent from participants</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informed consent from parent/guardian</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permission for access to sites/information/participants</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permission to use documents/copyright clearance</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data collection/survey instrument/questionnaire</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data collection instrument in appropriate language</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Only if necessary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other data collection instruments</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Only if used</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The UZREC retains the right to

- Withdraw or amend this Certificate if
  - Any unethical principles or practices are revealed or suspected
  - Relevant information has been withheld or misrepresented
  - Regulatory changes of whatsoever nature so require
  - The conditions contained in this Certificate have not been adhered to

- Request access to any information or data at any time during the course or after completion of the project

The UZREC wishes the researcher well in conducting the research

Professor Nokuthula Kunene
Chairperson: University Research Ethics Committee
11 February 2018
PB Ngubane - PGM 2015/239